



**Volume 8, Number 4 April 2015**

**Editor: Dr. Colleen Pinar**

**GEMS (Gender, Education, Music, & Society)**

**An online, peer-reviewed journal published in cooperation with Queen's University**  
**<http://library.queensu.ca/ojs/index.php/gems/index>**

# **GEMS (Gender, Education, Music, & Society)**

**An Online, Peer-Reviewed Journal Published In Cooperation With Queen's University**

<http://library.queensu.ca/ojs/index.php/gems/index>

**Volume 8, Number 4, April 2015**

Editor: Dr. Colleen Pinar

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

Mission Statement, Writing Style, And Copyright Statement

Editorial 2015

Dr. Colleen Pinar

## **ARTICLES**

From Dirty Little Secrets To Prime Time: Values, Metaphors, And Social Change At The 2015 Grammy Awards

Dr. Catherine A. Dobris & Rachel D. Davidson, MA

If Music Be The Food Of Love, Play On: Using Music As A Text To Explore Love In A Secondary English Classroom

Dani Goldstein, MA & Dr. Laraine Wallowitz

The Jodi Arias Saga: A Tragic Opera

Dr. Kristyan Kouri

## **Book Summary**

Women Music Educators In The United States: A History. By Dr. Sondra Wieland Howe

Dr. Sondra Wieland Howe

GEMS is a peer-reviewed, online journal that explores the myriad intersections between gender, education, music and society. Emphasis is on the ways in which music teaching and learning can be used to re-dress and

eliminate inequalities brought about through ideologies of domination by creating an open-ness to the musical experience that promotes access to all (and thus by extension, also the ways in which music teaching and learning have not been transformative in the past). Gender will be approached, not as male or female, but as a continuum of possibilities sustained by socially and historically constructed notions of masculinity and femininity that interact in complex, often competing and contradictory ways. A wide variety of methodological (historical, ethnographic, philosophical, sociological, etc.) and inter-disciplinary orientations will be featured, with contributors encouraged to make use of the variety of creative options presented by the electronic medium.

---

Materials submitted to GEMS must conform to the current edition of one of the following writing style manuals: *Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association*, *The Chicago Manual of Style*, or *A Manual for Writers of Term Papers, Theses, and Dissertations*. Articles and Book Reviews may not mix styles within a single manuscript. To allow for the identity of the author(s) to be transparent, it is requested that both first and last names be used when citing and when listed in the references.

For Text:

Roberta Lamb and Julia Koza brought feminist critiques of music education.

For References:

Gould, Elizabeth. (2011). Feminist imperative(s) in music and education: Philosophy, theory, or what matters most. *Educational Philosophy and Theory* 43(2), 130-147.

---

Copyright Notice: The policy of GEMS is that authors will retain copyright to their materials. However, authors grant GEMS permission to publish their materials in an online journal format with full-text access. It is the responsibility of the author to obtain all copyright permission prior to submission. Material appearing in GEMS may be shared among individuals for the purposes of scholarly research or discussion. Permission to copy or re-publish in any context or format must be secured in writing from the author(s), with advance notification given to the editor.

Views and content of each submission included in GEMS are the sole responsibility of the author. GEMS, the editor, and members of GEMS are not liable for any legal or civil actions that may arise involving the content including, but not limited to, copyright infringement.

Questions or comments? [gems\\_editor@yahoo.com](mailto:gems_editor@yahoo.com)

---

**GEMS Board:** Dr. Joseph Abramo (University of Connecticut), Dr. Estelle R. Jorgensen (Indiana University), and Dr. Melissa Natale-Abramo (Fine & Practical Arts Department Chairperson, North Salem Central School District).

**GEMS Editorial Team:** Dr. Vincent C. Bates (Weber State University), Dr. Robin Aaron Bright (Independent Scholar, UK), Dr. Rick Parker (Mississippi College), and Dr. Colleen Sears (The College of New Jersey).

## Editorial

I would like to welcome readers to the April 2015 issue of GEMS. Please let me know if you notice a PDF not working so that I may contact Scholar's Portal as soon as possible. I also would like to remind readers that PDFs may not download properly with Microsoft Internet Explorer. If you experience this, please use Mozilla Firefox or Google Chrome.

The last published issues of GEMS for this school year will be May. I encourage all readers to consider submitting an article, book review, book summary, CD review, or a CD summary for the May 2015 issue of GEMS. I was informed some readers could not access the Scholar's Portal to submit their article or book/CD review, if this happens to you, please email me your document. I would gladly consider it for publication in GEMS.

Dr. Catherine A. Dobris and Rachel D. Davidson in their article titled "From Dirty Little Secrets To Prime Time: Values, Metaphors, And Social Change At The 2015 Grammy Awards" discusses the themes of social change as a counterpoint to a celebration of popular culture in the 2015 Grammy Awards. In the 2015 broadcast of the 57th annual Grammy Awards, the venerable institution for the appraisal of popular music took a provocative stance on significant social justice issues as an integral thematic backdrop for the entertainment program. Even before the 2015 Grammy Awards was broadcast on February 8 from the Staples Center in Los Angeles, critics reported that a theme of social significance was being planned for the program. The authors conclude that an assessment of metaphors in the 2015 presentation of the Grammy Awards indicates a predominantly positive influence on an event that might otherwise be devoid of much serious content.

Dani Goldstein and Dr. Laraine Wallowitz in their article titled "If Music Be The Food Of Love, Play On: Using Music As A Text To Explore Love In A Secondary English Classroom" share their experiences as an English teacher in a secondary STEM school and her former English education professor collaborate on an article about their experience using music as a text to explore the concept of love in a secondary English classroom. Using the principles and practices of critical literacy and

backwards design, the teachers broaden the notion of reading and writing to include non-print texts such as music to help students negotiate love and gender in Shakespeare's "Romeo and Juliet" and popular music. Formal, informal, recorded, planned, or improv, music is a necessity in education because of what it provides for our children, but also because of what it allows our children to provide us: the ability to be surprised, and the chance to experience something again like it's the first time.

Dr. Kristyan Kouri in her article titled "The Jodi Arias Saga: A Tragic Opera" describes a modern saga and shares some similarities to a tragic opera. On June 4, 2008, 27-year-old Jodi Ann Arias murdered her lover, 30-year-old Travis Alexander. Demonized in the popular press, Arias is often depicted as a crazy jealous angry sociopath who had a fatal attraction toward a man who was largely indifferent to her. However, when her story is examined from a feminist perspective, the gendered sociological and psychological forces that influenced her decision to commit the brutal crime become apparent. According to popular opinion, Jodi Arias is a jealous, crazy, angry sociopath who had a fatal attraction toward Alexander. However, when looks at the case from a feminist perspective, the story reads like a tragic opera.

Dr. Sondra Wieland Howe provides GEMS readers with a summary of her book *Women Music Educators In The United States: A History*. *Women Music Educators* is a comprehensive narrative of women teaching music in the United States from colonial days until the end of the twentieth century. Traditional accounts of the history of music education have often neglected the contributions of women, because these texts have emphasized bands and the top leaders in hierarchical music organizations. This book describes women music educators' experiences throughout the United States and in many national organizations, then includes narratives and photos.

Dr. Colleen Pinar, Editor [gems\\_editor@yahoo.com](mailto:gems_editor@yahoo.com)

# **GEMS (Gender, Education, Music, & Society)**

Volume 8, Number 4, April 2015

## **From Dirty Little Secrets To Prime Time: Values, Metaphors, And Social Change At The 2015 Grammy Awards**

**Dr. Catherine A. Dobris & Rachel D. Davidson, MA**

© 2015 Catherine A. Dobris, cdobris@iupui.edu; Rachel D. Davidson, davids52@uwm.edu  
Copyright Notice: The policy of GEMS is that authors will retain copyright to their materials.

**Abstract:** This paper seeks to understand values articulated through the themes of social change as a counterpoint to a celebration of popular culture in the 2015 Grammy Awards. In this study, we provide a close reading of metaphors in five performances in order to address how contemporary values are juxtaposed with entertainment in this public context. The five artifacts selected for analysis include: President Obama's public service announcement, anti-domestic violence advocate Brooke Axtell's brief speech on behalf of survivors, pop star Katy Perry's performance of, "By the Grace of God," Australian singer Sia's performance of, "Chandelier," and Common and John Legend's performance of "Glory," from the film, *Selma*. We offer the current analysis as a means for understanding the larger rhetorical issue of how values are utilized to convey or motivate social action in a platform that some argue represent antithetical aims to social change rhetoric.

Music uplifts, celebrates, commemorates, highlights, heightens, sets the scene, inspires lovers, succors the wounded, and, in some cases, foments social change. Popular music reflects the culture and time period of its inception, and through performance can augment and even reinvent the meaning of its lyrics. Like most rhetorical forms, the genre of popular music may encompass the best and worst impulses inherent in the human condition. Both academic and social milieus embrace debate regarding the role of popular music in our society, asking to what extent popular discourse propels social change and to what extent it merely reflects it? A critic might ponder, to what degree is violence against women perpetuated in the “innocent” 1970’s sexism of a Todd Rundgren refrain intoning that “girls may be stupid, but they sure are fun,” or may consider the impact of Robin Thicke’s 2013 misogynist rap lyrics, proclaiming, “I know you want it.” When song lyrics aimed at young people, in particular, tell authentic stories of oppression and abuse, does the music merely reflect dysfunctional, even violent or illegal comportment? Does discourse in popular venues create injurious behavior? Is it possible that music has the power to turn victims into survivors and offer hope of healing to sufferers? Moreover, what level of responsibility, if any, do purveyors of popular culture have to their audience members beyond providing a diversion from day-to-day existence?

In the 2015 broadcast of the 57<sup>th</sup> annual Grammy Awards, the venerable institution for the appraisal of popular music took a provocative stance on significant social justice issues as an integral thematic backdrop for the entertainment program. Each year, beginning in 1959, the American National Academy of Recording Arts and Sciences has presented awards for outstanding achievement in the record industry. At its peak, the Grammy Awards has reached upwards of 28 million audience members, many in the under-thirty age bracket. The 57<sup>th</sup> presentation “averaged 24.8 million viewers and a[n] 8.3 rating among adults 18-49” (O’Connell n. pag.) but was “down more than 3 million viewers from last year’s performance” which “marks its lowest telecast since 2009” (O’Connell n. pag.). Nonetheless, the audience for the entertainment show is significant, thus the potential to reach millions in 30 second to 4 minute spots, is correspondingly impressive.

Two weeks after the Super Bowl telecast featured commercials, musical performances and public service announcements promoting modern-day visions of fatherhood and denouncing domestic violence, the Grammy Awards followed suit by incorporating carefully orchestrated themes featuring messages addressing domestic violence, substance abuse, and civil rights. Providing a serious framework for the entertainment program was not a new concept. In 2014, under the direction of executive producer, Ken Ehrlich, the Grammy Awards featured pro-Gay marriage rhetoric, in which thirty-three Gay and Lesbian couples were married as part of the musical presentation. This year, according to domestic abuse advocate Brooke Axtell, Ken Ehrlich “want[ed] to find ways to not only honor the creative work of their musicians and performing artists, but also to give them a platform to speak about issues that are important to them” (Kaplan n. pag.). Such issues undergirded the entertainment-based program, emerging in song, poem, and speech, and provided an alternative context for viewing musical performances and the bestowing of accolades, beyond the conventional award show scaffolding. This paper seeks to understand values articulated through the serious themes of social change as a counterpoint to a celebration of popular culture. In this study, we examine five performances from the Grammy Awards presentation in order to address how contemporary values are juxtaposed with entertainment in this public context. The five artifacts selected for analysis include: President Obama’s public service announcement, anti-domestic violence advocate Brooke Axtell’s brief speech on behalf of survivors, pop star Katy Perry’s performance of, “By the Grace of God,” Australian singer Sia’s performance of, “Chandelier,” and Common and John Legend’s performance of “Glory,” from the film, *Selma*. Each artifact addresses a social justice issue, such as domestic violence or racism, and was selected to illuminate the overall theme of the event. We investigate the extent to which social justice themes offset the negative messages associated with specific entertainment forms, such as popular music, which is often a repository of misogynist and other oppressive messages. We offer the current case study as a means for understanding the larger rhetorical issue of how values are utilized to convey or motivate social action

in a platform that some argue represent antithetical aims to social change rhetoric.

Even before the 2015 Grammy Awards was broadcast on February 8 from the Staples Center in Los Angeles, critics reported that a theme of social significance was being planned for the program. Neil Portnow, president and CEO of the Recording Academy, indicated that “a fair amount of social commentary” (Thompson n. pag.) would be incorporated in some of the performances. When the show aired, those messages were encompassed in a variety of formats, ranging from a pre-recorded public service announcement by President Obama on domestic violence, to a presumably spontaneous utterance on the part of pop icon, Prince, commenting, “Black lives matter,” in an unrelated award presentation for album of the year. Throughout the program, audiences were induced to consider social issues through musical performances, poetry, impromptu expressions, traditional rhetorical constructs, and alternative presentations of musical numbers such as Pharrell Williams’ contrary, rather dark take on his award-winning song, “Happy.” The theme of social justice was built into the structure and execution of the program.

### **Metaphorical Analysis**

Close textual analysis guides the methodology in the current study. We evaluate the significance of brief interludes and selected performances in the awards ceremony as indicative of a broader schemata of social messages embedded in the structure of the event. Although our texts for this study encompass fragments of the 2015 Grammy awards, as Kenneth Burke illuminates, partial accounts may characterize the whole because “in reality, we are capable of but partial acts, acts that but partially represent us and that produce but partial transformations” (“A Grammar of Motives” 19). Examination of metaphors as they are utilized in the discourse suggests the advancement of particular cultural values in juxtaposition with the rhetorical situation. The current analysis reveals how a theme of social justice is integrated in a platform that sometimes celebrates an antithetical stance in the very substance of themes and lyrics embedded in popular music. Because the social justice theme in the 2015 Grammys is tied to issues that are traditionally privatized, including domestic violence and substance

abuse, a critical lens helps make sense of the private subject/public platform negotiation. Additionally, employing close textual analysis provides an appropriate lens to understand the social justice theme in the 2015 Grammys in which the personal manifestly becomes the political.

Using close textual analysis, we examine values revealed through metaphors observing selected social justice themes, which emerge throughout the program. Employing Michael Osborn’s conceptualization of metaphor as “an event that occurs in the minds of listeners, often with important consequences for attitude and action” (80) we suggest that metaphors offer insight into this case study for understanding how the social justice theme invites a response in the context of the 2015 Grammys. Because metaphors, as rhetorical devices, reveal much about understanding our everyday experience (Lakoff & Johnson), metaphoric analysis provides an inroad for critics to interpret advocacy rhetoric. Our analysis suggests five themes that emerge as values from the overall collection of identified metaphors: agency, community, cooperation, equality, and process. Although all five do not inhere in each artifact, the themes co-construct a worldview, which is consistent throughout the awards show. In what follows, we analyze the Grammy performances in the chronological order in which they appeared during the 2015 telecast.

### **Obama’s Public Service Announcement**

Midway through the Grammy awards, without fanfare or even a nominal introduction, President Obama emerged in an 84 second public service announcement, urging Americans to enlist in the “It’s On Us” campaign, “an anti-domestic violence campaign the Obama administration launched last year” (Plank n. pag.). In his video announcement, “Obama called on musicians to use their power to bring awareness to rape and domestic violence against women” (Hope n. pag.). His brief speech garnered scant praise from detractors who noted that his homily neglected to examine both the misogynist lyrics promoted within the music industry as well as performers encouraging violence against women through their personal example and professional choices. The following chart reveals Obama’s reliance on metaphors that invoke *agency*, *community*, *process*,

cooperation, and equality in attempting to motivate spectators to take the pledge at ItsOnUs.org.

### Metaphors

<i>Vehicle</i>	<i>Tenor</i>
Celebrate artists	Acclaiming talented professionals
Helped shape our culture	Forming and structuring attitudes, values and principles which underlie our image of Americans
We can change our culture	Asserting control over that image
Ending violence	Obliterate brutality
Unique power	Exceptional ability to make a significant change
To change minds and attitudes	Alter negative patterns in others
To set an example	Model what we want others to be
Join our campaign to stop this violence	Become part of the mainstream group
“ItsOnUs.org”	Take responsibility
Take the pledge	Vow, oath, promise
And to the artists at the Grammy’s tonight, I ask you to ask your fans to do it too	Direct appeal to artists to be role models to audience members
It is on us, all of us,	Responsibility to create change
To create a culture where violence isn’t tolerated	We can change what has always been
Where survivors are supported	We no longer “blame the victim”
And where all our young people	Focus shifts from women to youth, male and female
Can go as far as their talents and dreams will take them	Young people can do anything, unfettered by violence

President Obama begins by offering praise to the entertainers, appropriate to a venue in which performers are being honored for their accomplishments in the music industry. But while he applauds their contributions, which “shape our culture,” he also challenges them to make conscious choices concerning how that culture is fashioned. By assigning them *agency* within the music business, he asserts that their obligation is beyond providing entertainment, indicating that they have a significant role in promoting *equality* specifically as regards to gender in the context of reducing and even “ending violence.” He positions the music industry, and the individual artists who populate that industry, as both a part of a *community* and as leaders in an on-going *process* “to create a culture where violence isn’t tolerated” and “where survivors are supported.” Obama’s plea for support of “ItsOnUs.org,” unequivocally asks performers to *cooperate* in assuming agency for inducing social change from their position of privilege as celebrities. His message is one

in which women are survivors, rather than victims, and in which youth, the primary focus of popular music, will benefit from an improved society. Obama emphasizes the collective nature of the issue of domestic violence, but in doing so, deflects notions of gender and how this larger systemic characteristic perpetuates domestic violence. In this sense, *equality* is emphasized as *cooperation* between *community* members, populated exclusively by celebrities with *agency*, which becomes the primary *process* by which social change is enacted.

#### Brooke Axtell’s Speech On Domestic Violence

Domestic violence advocate Brooke Axtell’s brief speech on behalf of survivors also served as an introduction to Katy Perry’s ballad about her emergence from an unhealthy romantic involvement (Rutter n. pag.). Axtell was the victim of sexual trafficking from the age of seven, when her parents were unable to care for her and she was put under the guardianship of a man referred to as, “Jim” (Kaplan n.

pag.). Axtell has previously described the nightmare of sexual abuse she suffered for years, being sold to men who raped her and filmed the violent attacks for pleasure and profit (Kaplan n. pag.). Later, when she was free of her captors, she involved herself in an adult relationship with a man who beat and mistreated her, eventually threatening to kill her. When she finally sought assistance, Axtell became an advocate for victims of abuse. According to an article in *The Washington Post*:

Axtell describes the role art played in helping her recover from her experiences. A singer and poet, she has released three albums and two collections of poetry. Art . . . is what made her a survivor, not a victim. “When we express our creativity, we have the power to decide how we will relate to our trauma and the story we will tell about our lives,” she said. (Kaplan n. pag.)

Axtell is a founder of “Healing and Empowerment, a support group for victims of sexual violence,” and is also associated with the “Rape,

Abuse and Incest National Network” and “SafePlace,” a domestic violence shelter in her hometown of Austin” (Kaplan n. pag.). Asked if she was concerned about whether her comments might be exploited “as part of a PR stunt,” Axtell confidently responded:

If I were just there to stand up as some sort of prop to promote [Perry], I don’t think I’d be given so much range and freedom to have my own content . . . They accepted the first version that I sent them. . . . Not a word has been changed. (Kaplan n. pag.)

Axtell’s brief prose poem detailing her abuse was inserted after Obama’s public service announcement and as introduction to Katy Perry’s performance of, “By the Grace of God.” Perry wrote about her own experience emerging from an unhealthy relationship and apparently struck a chord among abuse survivors (Kaplan n. pag.). Similar to Obama’s public service announcement, themes of *agency*, *community*, *process*, *cooperation*, and *equality* are found embedded in the metaphors employed in Axtell’s spoken poem.

### Metaphors

<i>Vehicle</i>	<i>Tenor</i>
Survivor	One who has moved past a traumatic event
Domestic violence	Physical abuse within the private sphere, presumably within the context of family
Passionate romance	A love relationship that is strong and usually sexual in nature
Charismatic man	Charming
I was stunned	Stopped
Abuse me	Physically and emotionally harmed
Lashing out	Using words or actions to harm another
He was in pain	He has emotional/psychological baggage
Needed help	Emotional or possibly psychiatric assistance
Compassion could restore him	If she didn’t judge him and loved him, he would become the good person he is presumed to have been before being “hurt”
Empathy was used against me	Because she showed caring for him, he hurt her
Terrified of him	Afraid for her life
Ashamed I was in this position.	Felt she was to blame for the abuse
Bound me to him	She couldn’t leave
Desire to heal him	She wanted to help him despite the fact that he was hurting her

My compassion was incomplete because it did not include me.	She did not value herself
I had to escape	Get away from the abuse
Revealed the truth	Realize that this was abuse
Seek help	Seek professional intervention
Saved my life	Saved her from being killed by her abuser
Authentic love	Love that does not entail abuse
Devalue another human being	Abuse another
Silence	Keep the abuse secret
Shame	Feeling it is her fault
Abuse	Physical, mental, emotional
Honor	Doing what is right for self
Respect	Regard for self
Worthy of love	Good enough for someone to care about her
Reach out for help	Ask a friend a professional for assistance
Your voice will save you	Speaking out, you can save yourself
Let it extend into the night	Speak out on behalf of yourself
Let it part the darkness	Hopeful
Let it set you free	Get away from your abuser
To know who you truly are	Know that you are a good person who does not deserve abuse
Valuable	Important to yourself and others
Beautiful	On the inside
Loved	By others and possibly by God

In Axtell's speech, *agency*, *equality*, *community*, *process*, and *cooperation* work together to suggest that individual survivors can remove themselves from abusive situations. However, according to Axtell's text, this individual *agency* is only enacted with the *cooperation* of a larger *community*; in this case professional intervention or assistance from others is a precondition for effective action. As both a survivor of abuse and an advocate of support groups, it may be expected that Axtell would promote a message of individual healing as a *process* that occurs within a larger *community* of professionals, trained to help individuals move from victim to survivor. She also underscores the lack of *equality* victims feel, explaining "my compassion was incomplete because it did not include me," which deprives them of the *agency* that Axtell seeks to restore to survivors. Her final words move her personal story to create consubstantiality with her audience, entreating victims of abuse to use their "voice[s]" to speak out against abuse and reminding them that they are each "valuable," "beautiful," and loved."

### **Katy Perry's Performance Of, "By the Grace of God"**

Selected as Billboard's 2012 "Woman of the Year," Perry aggravated feminists by her "I am not a feminist," declaration, as she accepted her honor from the preeminent proprietor of the entertainment industry (Davies n. pag.). While few feminists would take issue with her claim that her work has not been particularly feminist in nature, in the context of her award, her disavowal was disheartening. Although Perry has previously written and performed song lyrics hinting that date rape might be okay (Davies n. pag.) and that sexual involvement with another woman for her boyfriend's amusement could be fun, such proclamations, which distance public figures from feminism, are disappointing when they indicate a fundamental misunderstanding of what feminism "is" (i.e., equal rights and opportunities) and "is not" (i.e., male bashing). Nevertheless, some of Perry's songs, like "Firework," have had the capacity to inspire her young audiences, while reinforcing self-esteem and positive regard for individuality and uniqueness. These

are messages, which can certainly be placed within a feminist lexicon, despite the artist's lack of affinity for feminism in general. In, "By the Grace of God," Perry reflects on a damaging relationship which drives her to the brink of suicide but from which she finally emerges intact. Themes of *agency, community, process, cooperation, and equality*, are resonant through her choice of metaphors.

### Metaphors

<i>Vehicle</i>	<i>Tenor</i>
Surviving my return of Saturn	Surviving her divorce
Long vacation	Death
Full of secrets	Not telling anyone what was happening
Locked up tight like iron mountain	Secretive
Running on empty	Had no inner resources
So out of gas	No energy
I wasn't enough	Could not stand up for herself
Found I wasn't so tough	Thought she was being strong, staying in this relationship and discovered this was weakness
Layin' on the bathroom floor	Beaten
We were living on a fault line	At any moment, everything can disintegrate and we can't control what happens to us
And I felt the fault was all mine	She believed that she was the cause of the relational problems
Couldn't take it anymore	Realized she no longer was willing to be mistreated
By the grace of God	Saved by a higher power
I picked myself back up	Decided to face destructive forces in her life
I knew I had to stay	Decided to live
I put one foot in front of the other	Took a small step toward her own salvation
And I looked in the mirror and decided to stay	Decided not to kill herself
Wasn't gonna let love take me out that way	Decided that she did not want to die for a misconstrued idea about romantic love
Keeping my head above the water	Surviving
When the truth was like swallowing sand	Difficult to come to terms with the truth of her unhealthy relationship
Now every morning, there is no more mourning	No longer a victim but a survivor
Oh, I can finally see myself again	Sees the good in herself
I know I am enough	Realizes her worth
Possible to be loved	Realizes she deserves real love
It was not about me	The abuser is in the wrong and nothing she did brought on the situation or could have ended it
Now I have to rise above	Has to be strong enough to keep going no matter how hard it is
Let the universe call the bluff	There is some meta-perspective that can judge this situation fairly and assess that she is in the right and he is wrong
Yeah, the truth'll set you free	Now that she knows that she does not deserve to be in a bad situation, and she can go on with her life

Not in the name of love	Will not subjugate herself because she cares about someone who doesn't care about her. This is not love
I am not giving up	Not going to die

In contrast to Axtell's focus on *process* from victim to survivor, Perry's song reveals that individuals have the *agency* to enact this *process* by critical self-reflection. Whereas *cooperation* and *community* were essential in Axtell's discursively constructed process of becoming a survivor, Perry empowers the audience to understand that the power of change lies within themselves. However, the lyrics of Perry's song, coupled with the performance of the song at the Grammys, suggest there exists a larger *community* standing behind individuals undergoing the process from victim to survivor. This was vividly enacted through a visual metaphor of performance when Perry took the stage in front of a white screen wearing an all-white dress with what appeared to be her shadow illuminated on the display. As she began to sing, the shadow proved to be several dancers who were performing behind the white screen (Dillon & Vanmetre n. pag.). The multiple, but faceless dancers, indicate that the survivor, Perry, is still the primary focus and has primary *agency* in her role as survivor, yet there exists a *community* of others supporting her in this role. Perry's all-white dress can be understood as a metaphorical blank slate, suggesting the song is not about her as survivor, but serves as a voice for all survivors. In Perry's song she triumphs over her demons and offers a hopeful scenario for the future. A happy ending is not assured, since *process* is always on-going, but her audience can identify with an expectation of a favorable outcome.

**Sia's Performance Of "Chandelier"**

Sia Furler, known singularly as "Sia," focused on alcoholism, drug addiction and suicide, all issues from

her personal narrative, in a dramatic performance of her Grammy nominated song, "Chandelier." Called "socially phobic" by *New York Times Magazine* (Knopper n. pag.), this prolific singer-song writer has provided top hits for mega-stars Christina Aguilera, Beyoncé, and Rihanna. In her own performances, as in this Grammy show piece, she often makes dramatic social statements, but employs the unusual technique of hiding her face from the audience. In interviews, the singer-songwriter claims she wants to avoid celebrity, admitting, "I thought it would be a funny joke that I'm getting away with . . . And it was, partly, I don't wanna go out and sell my soul, my body, my peace of mind" (Sanders n. pag). According to *National Public Radio* journalist, Sam Sanders:

Sia now refuses to be photographed. She was on the cover of *Billboard* magazine recently, with a paper bag over her head . . . and when she does perform, it's with her back to the audience. (Sanders n. pag.)

During her Grammy performance of "Chandelier," she stood with her back to the audience, while dancers outfitted in matching blonde "bob" wigs and other accouterments identical to the artist, performed an interpretative dance to her song about addiction. While she is known to produce popular songs at a rapid pace for her famous clientele, her songs have also been dubbed, "victim to victory," compositions (Knopper n. pag.), making her an ideal choice for this year's theme of social justice. Themes of *agency*, *community*, *equality*, and *process* are revealed through the coding of metaphors in the lyrics of her song.

**Metaphors**

<i>Vehicle</i>	<i>Tenor</i>
Party girls	Females that are young and using alcohol and/or drugs to have fun
Don't get hurt	Women are immune to damage physically, mentally, emotionally
Can't feel anything	Emotionally numb

When will I learn	Rhetorical question; despite repetition, keeps making same mistakes
Push it down	Not deal with what is happening, pretending it isn't; not getting rid of it though—it is still there
For a good time call	Anonymous, promiscuous sexual activity; a name and number scrawled on a wall
Phone's blowing up	Doing drugs, drinking and having sex in a continuous cycle (so many people are "calling" for a "good time")
Ringin' my doorbell	The alcohol, drugs, and sex are tempting her
Feel the love	The influence of alcohol and drugs make her happy for a little while
Throw 'em back	Drinking and taking drugs
Til I lose count	She has no idea how much she is drinking and she's trying not to care
Holding on for dear life	Reaching a breaking point
Won't look down	She's terrified
Won't open my eyes	Avoiding problems
Keep my glass full until morning light	Trying to get through another day
'Cause I'm just holding on for tonight	She has no plan for anything beyond this moment
Help me	Needs assistance from others; can't do this on her own
Sun is up	Facing another day
I'm a mess Gotta get out now	After-effects of drugs, alcohol and sex
Gotta run from this	Need to stop doing this
Here comes the shame	Feeling this is all bad
Throw 'em back till I lose count	Keep drinking
I'm gonna swing from the chandelier	She is going to have unrestrained alcohol, drugs and sex, regardless of the danger
I'm gonna live like tomorrow doesn't exist	She is not considering the implications of what she is doing
I'm gonna fly like a bird through the night	"Flying" is drug and alcohol induced but birds usually fly in daylight, so she has no idea where she is or where she is going
Feel my tears as they dry	She is not going to feel sorry for herself

Clearly, the predominant theme in Sia's dirge is the endless cycle of drug and alcohol abuse and her inability to interrupt the sequence of destructive behaviors and their negative repercussions. Themes of *agency*, *community* and *process* emerge from the dance performance as well as from her lyrics. Unlike other artifacts with social messages, Sia's enactment, seeks to share the worldview of the victim/survivor with the audience, connecting to a like *community* of abusers and those affected by the drug and alcohol abuse of others, and affording insight to outsiders by means of creating empathy. *Agency*, or at least personal responsibility, is dimly recognizable in

phrases such as, "when will I learn," and "gotta get out now . . . gotta run from this." In contrast to Obama's plea to the musical community to be proactive, Sia's weak request for "help" reduces her scenario to victims and heroes. Similarly, while other artifacts highlight process as something linear and progressive, for Sia, *process* is an endless cycle with little hope for redemption. However, the key metaphors in her offering may be more salient in the performance by dancers Kristen Wiig and Maddie Ziegler, than in her lyrics. In the performance, Sia does not interact with her audience, while Wiig and Ziegler, dressed in look-alike wigs and outfits, present an interpretative dance

against the backdrop of a run-down apartment. The much smaller Ziegler has been referred to in blog posts as Sia's "childhood self" (Washington n. pag.), while Wiig represents the present-day Sia, struggling metaphorically as well as literally with her damaged, younger self. Only once do Sia's lyrics indicate that she cannot do this on her own, when she cries out to a nameless visage, "help me." But the final dance steps, accompanied by her reflection, "feel my tears as they dry," end her performance with ambiguity regarding to what extent she will let herself be helped or allow herself to heal. She appears to be wedged in a *process* in which she cannot reach out beyond herself to the *community* who might be able to save her. Personal *agency* is thwarted and *equality* is denied. Sia's preference to avoid facing the audience fits with the audience's expectations of her "socially phobic" performance style, however, understood within the context of the 2015 Grammys, this choice also suggests that Sia's personal narrative provides a universal face for others who have substance abuse issues. The selections made within the performance may disclose that the song is less about Sia and her internal struggles, and more about providing others a way to see themselves in their own *process* of internal struggle, and the barriers to *community* and *agency* embedded in that struggle.

### Common And John Legend Perform, "Glory"

Performers Common and John Legend, backed with a full choir, offered a dramatic rendition of "Glory" from the Grammy and Academy award nominated film, *Selma*, which chronicled Martin Luther King's famed march from Selma to Montgomery, Alabama, in support of the Voting Rights Act of 1965. Common reflects on his artistic role as "storyteller," observing:

You got to be able to speak the truth, you've got to be able to absorb life and take in life and be able to interpret it in a way that anybody in this room could say, 'Man, that's my story, I can relate to that.' And it's just finding the humanity in the stories and the creativity in the stories. That's what it means to me. (Gallo n. pag.)

Common's remarks disclose his efforts to create consubstantiality through the lyrics, music and performance of his art. The following chart reveals emphasis on the themes of *agency*, *community*, *process*, and *equality* in their performance of "Glory."

### Metaphors

<i>Vehicle</i>	<i>Tenor</i>
One day	In the future
When the glory comes	When we have racial justice but also a reference to Jesus' return
It will be ours	African Americans will have it
When the war is won	Racial justice
Hands to the Heavens	Be good Christians
No man, no weapon Formed against	Nonaggression
Yes glory is destined	Racial justice will happen
Every day women and men become legends	Common people become everyday champions
Sins that go against our skin become blessings	Acts of racism inspires us to overcome
The movement is a rhythm to us	African Americans are all inspired by the crusade
Freedom is like religion to us	Racial justice is a part of Christianity
Justice for all just ain't specific enough	The pledge of allegiance does not go far enough and does not protect all of us, African Americans in particular
One son died, his spirit is revisitin' us	May refer to Jesus or to Martin Luther King
Truant livin' in us, resistance is us	African Americans can confront, oppose, challenge, defy
That's why Rosa sat on the bus	Rosa Parks stood up for racial justice more than 60 years ago

That's why we walk through Ferguson with our hands up	Reference to shooting of Michael Brown in Ferguson, Missouri and protests where people put their hands up in solidarity with Brown
When it go down we woman and man up	When there is trouble, African Americans are strong
They say, "Stay down" and we stand up	African Americans defy oppression
Shots, we on the ground, the camera panned up	The media and even the mainstream culture, purposefully chooses not to highlight oppression and racism against African Americans
King pointed to the mountain top and we ran up	King showed African Americans the way to oppose racism through peaceful means and we have followed his lead
One day, when the glory comes It will be ours, it will be ours	We will achieve racial equality
When the war is won	When we achieve racial equality
We will be sure, we will be here sure	We will know when we have achieved it
Glory	Equality
Now the war is not over	We aren't done yet
Victory isn't won	We aren't done yet
Then when it's all done And we'll fight on to the finish	We will continue until we have racial justice
Selma's now for every man, woman and child	What King did at Selma and what was portrayed in the film, "Selma," can inspire us all
Even Jesus got his crown in front of a crowd	Jesus did not act alone
They marched with the torch	He was supported by early Christian followers
We gon' run with it now	We must follow in the tradition of early Christians
Never look back	Don't get mired is past issues or failures
We done gone hundreds of miles	We have already come a long way
From dark roads he rose	Jesus also rose from a difficult path
To become a hero	He achieved immortality
Facin' the league of justice	Standing up to the judicial branch of the government, law makers (Justice Department). Possibly a reference to the Justice League (D.C. comics superheroes) (Harris)
His power was the people	Strength and force emerges from all of us behind and as a part of our leaders
Enemy is lethal	Oppression and racism will lead to death
A king became regal	Martin Luther King and Jesus became dignified through their struggles for a larger cause
Saw the face of Jim Crow under a bald eagle	We recognize the incongruity of juxtaposing racism with patriotism
The biggest weapon is to stay peaceful	We can achieve racial equality through nonviolent means
We sing	We speak out
Our music is the cuts that we bleed through	Our voices are inspired by our pain; we turn pain into strength
Somewhere in the dream we had an epiphany	Martin Luther King's "dream" is expanded upon
Now we right the wrongs in history	Reparation

No one can win the war individually	Collectivity
It takes the wisdom of the elders	Need to profit by those who have been part of working toward racial equality since King
And young people's energy	Need to inspire youth to be part of the movement
Welcome to the story	The quest toward racial justice
We call victory	When we have achieved racial justice
The comin' of the Lord	Reference to Battle Hymn of Republic
My eyes have seen the glory	Reference to Battle Hymn of Republic
When it's all said and done	When we have achieved our goal
We'll cry glory	We will have achieved our goal and will thank God

In "Glory," *equality* and *community* become elements of the *process* of social change. *Agency* is attributed to 1) the African American community, 2) entertainers, 3) audience members, 4) Christians, 5) young and old, and ultimately all who are willing to join and "fight on to the finish." Martin Luther King is compared to Jesus Christ, and the audience is enjoined to "call victory," only when "we right the wrongs in history" and "the Lord" has "come." The performance of "Glory" and the values embedded in the song's metaphors bring together the other performance's themes including *equality*, *community*, individual and collective *agency*, social change as *process*, and triumph in personal and collective victories. Their performance brought many audience members to tears and most present to their feet in a standing ovation.

Similar to those critics who objected that Obama's speech was oxymoronic given the context, some critics objected to an overly sentimental tribute to Martin Luther King at the "whitest Grammy awards in years," pointing out that few African American entertainers were honored for their contributions (Kristobak, n. pag.). The dramatic inclusion of so many Black performers for this finale was striking in this context. Nevertheless, that this performance closed the 2015 Grammys and brought together many of the social justice themes of the night suggests that "Glory" could be read as a climatic end to the 2015 Grammys and to the night's theme of social justice.

### Conclusions: Values Expressed

In the current study, coding metaphors for values is employed as a means for understanding the larger rhetorical issue of how values are utilized to convey or motivate social action in a platform that some argue represent issues antithetical to the rhetoric

of social change. As Rachel Davidson suggests, "Values are always embedded in our language choices. Values coach us and give us clues to society's preferences" (57). Furthermore, values demonstrate one of the many practical tools that the rhetorical discipline offers to scholars and practitioners, in part, because, critics "can look at the rhetorical dimension of value in texts to uncover how those texts are employing values to make persuasive discourse" (Davidson 57). Important for the current analysis, values offer an understanding of attitudes and beliefs, which are undergirded by the larger structure of our morals and ideals.

This analysis reveals two important lessons to consider with regard to the larger rhetorical issue of promoting social transformation in a setting that sometimes fosters messages contrary to proactive social change. First, this study discloses that close attention should be paid to what values are selected to represent social change and what is subsequently deflected in that selection. Analysis of the 2015 Grammys invites us to think about social change through the themes of *agency*, *community*, *process*, *cooperation*, and *equality*. These themes are emphasized by pointing to the collective nature of domestic issues, highlighting internal struggles through personal narratives, and offering stories about triumph and survival. However, in every selection there is a deflection. As Kenneth Burke observes, "even if any given terminology is a reflection of reality, by its very nature as a terminology it must be a selection of reality; and to this extent it must function also as a deflection of reality" ("Language as Symbolic Action" 45). Although the presentation of the performances offers motivating narratives to understand social change, these themes deflect a larger

discussion about gender and power. In other words, the producers of the Grammy Awards select particular social change narratives, but deflect the larger systemic issues, such as gender and power, that perpetuate barriers to legitimate social change.

The second lesson this analysis uncovers is attention to symbolic tension between values revealed through the metaphors. For example, our examination exposes tension in understanding the *process* of social change. All of the Grammy performances grapple with *agency* in motivating the *process* of social change. Obama's public service announcement suggests that celebrities have the power to motivate social change, whereas Common and John Legend's performance suggests that everyday individuals have power to enact social change. Sia's enactment implies that *agency* may not be possible, while Brooke Axtell's speech indicates that it is, but only in concert with a larger *community*. For Katy Perry, *agency* is part of a larger journey of self-discovery and personal enactment. These tensions in *agency* are instructive in understanding the extent to which popular culture venues, such as the 2015 Grammys, propel or merely reflect social change.

While some argue that entertainment should not go beyond its reach as amusement for the masses, others argue that since theatrical performance has always exerted more influence than merely providing a diversion, it has a concomitant obligation to educate audiences in order to counterbalance the negative messages promoted by some performers. If we desire to live in a democratic universe of ideas in which Chris Brown is permitted to promote date rape drugs with lyrics such as, "Put Molly all in her champagne, she ain't even know it. I took her home and I enjoyed that, she ain't even know it," to vulnerable teenagers, then it is sensible that the entertainment industry takes tutelage of the cultural implications of those messages, as a serious charge.

But to what extent can social justice themes offset the negative messages associated with specific entertainment forms, such as football, which glorifies violence, and the music industry, which is sometimes a repository for misogynist and other oppressive messages? Although it is appropriate and important for entertainment venues to take responsibility in promoting social justice themes, the current study indicates that efforts to motivate social change through

themes of *agency*, *community*, *process*, *cooperation*, and *equality*, may not be enough to counteract the negative messages associated with the popular music industry. For example, Obama's message prompted comments such as:

Let's be real. This is a music culture that rewards lyrics demeaning and abusing women. Obama wants to stop domestic violence by raising awareness. What better setting than Grammy night? What better audience than the artists and producers who profit off it?" (Easton n. pag.)

Moreover, some critics decried the presence of artists in attendance including Chris Brown and R. Kelly, "who both have documented, serious histories with their treatment of women, were both nominated in the Best R&B Performance category, with the former up for two other categories" (Greenwald n. pag.). Madeline Boardman observes that "many viewers took to Twitter in the midst of the segment to express their disbelief that the same show was warning against domestic abuse and sexual misconduct while honoring both men" (n. pag.). These responses indicate that careful attention must be paid to promoting a message, which many agreed was appropriate and necessary, in a setting where contradictory messages are celebrated and even rewarded.

Conversely, even if some viewers were offended by the ideological juxtaposition, the risk was compensated by prompting important discussion via social media. Although there was clearly some public pushback regarding the social justice messages, the same voices who critiqued the discourse also documented evidence of a larger public conversation in which citizen advocates enacted their *agency*, weighing in on issues of social change. Inspiring discussion and critical reflection on the theme of social change in popular programs such as the Grammy Awards, allows collective institutions to take responsibility for leading the way on issues that demand input from everyone in our culture. Productions such as award shows offer untapped potential for transforming culturally entrenched attitudes and behaviors. As Brooke Axtell told reporters, "both she and Perry were honored by the opportunity to address the issue before such a large audience" ("Katy Perry," n. pag.). Thus, the 2015

Grammys initiated this essential set of public dialogues and, as such, offers an important contribution in generating political awareness of issues that are traditionally grounded in the private sphere.

We conclude that an assessment of metaphors in the 2015 presentation of the Grammy Awards indicates a predominantly positive influence on an event that might otherwise be devoid of much serious content. How those messages are conveyed, what messages are absent, and what role context plays on the reception of those messages, is critical in apprehending the overall effects of inducing social change through celebrations of popular culture. Is this a step in the right direction? We believe so. But like so many other aspects of cultural evolution, we still have a long way to travel in promoting social justice while advancing artistic freedom of expression. In the 1950's and 60's, folk and rock singers sought to revolutionize society through music. In the 21<sup>st</sup> century, their mission continues as both a part and a counterpart to mainstream cultural events.

### Works Cited

- Boardman, Madeline. "Grammys Called Hypocritical for Sending Domestic Violence Message While Nominating Chris Brown, R. Kelly." *USMagazine.com*, 2015. Web. <<http://www.usmagazine.com/celebrity-news/news/grammys-send-domestic-violence-message-while-nominating-chris-brown-201592>>.
- Burke, Kenneth. *Language as Symbolic Action: Essays on Life, Literature, and Method*. Berkeley & Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1966. Electronic.
- Burke, Kenneth. *A Grammar of Motives*. Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press, 1969. Print.
- Davidson, Rachel. "Rhetorical Lessons in Advocacy and Shared Responsibility: Family Metaphors and Definitions of Crisis and Care in Unpaid Family Caregiving Rhetoric." Diss. University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee, 2015. Print.
- Davies, Madeleine. "Katy Perry, Billboard's Woman of the Year, Is 'Not a Feminist.'" *Jezebel.com*, 2012. Web. 9 March 2015.
- <<http://jezebel.com/5964727/katy-perry-billboards-woman-of-the-year-is-not-a-feminist>>.
- Dillon, Nancy and Elizabeth Vanmetre. "Katy Perry's Grammy Performance Sheds Light on Domestic Violence as President Obama, Brooke Axtell Help Make Message Clear." *NYDailynews.com*, 2015. Web. 17 February 2015. <<http://www.nydailynews.com/entertainment/music/katy-perry-grammy-performance-sheds-light-violence-article-1.2107904>>.
- Easton, Nina. "2015 Grammys: Obama Missed the Moment on Domestic Abuse." *Fortune.com*, 2014. Web. 15 February 2015. <<http://fortune.com/2015/02/11/obama-domestic-abuse-grammys/>>.
- Gallo, Phil. "Backstage at the Oscars with John Legend & Common." *Billboard.com*, 2015. Web. 11 March 2015. <<http://www.billboard.com/articles/events/oscars/6480269/backstage-at-the-oscars-with-john-legend-common>>.
- Greenwald, David. "The Grammys Take on Domestic Abuse, but Specter of Violence Lingers." *Oregonlive.com*, 2015. Web. 15 February 2015. <[http://www.oregonlive.com/music/index.ssf/2015/02/the\\_grammys\\_domestic\\_abuse.html](http://www.oregonlive.com/music/index.ssf/2015/02/the_grammys_domestic_abuse.html)>.
- Harris, Aisha. "Please, Don't Honor Selma by Giving the Oscar to 'Glory.'" *Slate.com*, 2015. Web. 21 March 2015. <[http://www.slate.com/blogs/browbeat/2015/02/19/\\_glory\\_by\\_john\\_legend\\_and\\_common\\_please\\_don\\_t\\_give\\_it\\_the\\_oscar\\_for\\_best.html](http://www.slate.com/blogs/browbeat/2015/02/19/_glory_by_john_legend_and_common_please_don_t_give_it_the_oscar_for_best.html)>.
- Hope, Clover. "President Obama Delivers an Intense Grammys PSA on Domestic Abuse." *Jezebel.com*, 2015. Web. 3 March 2015. <<http://jezebel.com/president-obama-delivers-an-intense-grammys-psa-on-dome-1684590013>>.
- Kaplan, Sarah. "Brook Axtell, Survivor of Human Trafficking and Domestic Abuse, Storms the Grammys." *Washington Post*, 2014. Web. 14 February 2015. <<http://www.washingtonpost.com/news/morning-mix/wp/2015/02/09/brooke-axtell-survivor-of-human-trafficking-and-domestic-abuse-storms-the-grammys/>>.
- "Katy Perry, Brooke Axtell, President Obama Address Domestic Violence at the 2015 Grammys." *Wkbw.com*, 2015. Web. 16 February 2015.

- <<http://www.wkbw.com/news/katy-perry-brooke-axtell-president-obama-address-domestic-violence-at-the-2015-grammys>>.
- Knopper, Steve. "Sia Furler, the Socially Phobic Pop Star." *The New York Times Magazine*, 2014. Web. 8 March 2015.  
<[http://www.nytimes.com/2014/04/20/magazine/sia-furler-the-socially-phobic-pop-star.html?\\_r=0](http://www.nytimes.com/2014/04/20/magazine/sia-furler-the-socially-phobic-pop-star.html?_r=0)>.
- Kristobak, Ryan. "Do the Grammys Have a Race Problem? The 2015 Grammys The Whitest in 35 Years." *The Huffington Post*, 2015. Web. 15 February 2015.  
<[http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2015/02/11/grammys-race-problem\\_n\\_6663640.html](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2015/02/11/grammys-race-problem_n_6663640.html)>.
- Lakoff, George & Mark Johnson. *Metaphors We Live By*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1980. Print.
- O'Connell, Michael. "TV Ratings: Grammy Awards Lose 3 Million Viewers From Last Year." *Hollywoodreporter.com.*, 2015. Web. 4 March 2105. <<http://www.hollywoodreporter.com/live-feed/tv-ratings-grammy-awards-lose-771653>>.
- Osborn, Michael. "The Trajectory of My Work with Metaphor." *Southern Communication Journal* 74.1 (2009): 79-87. Electronic.
- Plank, Elizabeth. "President Obama Made a Surprise Appearance at the Grammys With a Video You Need to See." *Mic.com*, 2015. 3 March 2015.  
<<http://www.mic.com/articles/110126/president-obama-made-a-surprise-appearance-at-the-grammys-with-a-video-you-need-to-see>>.
- Rutter, Claire. "2015 Grammys: Brooke Axtell delivers passionate speech about domestic violence with Chris Brown and Rihanna in the audience." *Mirror.com*, 2015. Web. 9 march 2015. <<http://www.mirror.co.uk/3am/celebrity-news/2015-grammys-brooke-axtell-delivers-5130092>>.
- Sanders, Sam. "A Reluctant Star, Sia Deals with Fame on Her Own Terms." *NPR*, 2014. Web. 13 March 2015.  
<<http://www.npr.org/2014/07/08/329500971/a-reluctant-star-sia-deals-with-fame-on-her-own-terms>>.
- Thompson, Arienne. "Grammys Take a Serious Turn with Domestic Violence PSA." *USAToday*, 2014. Web. 13 February 2015.
- <<http://www.usatoday.com/story/life/people/2015/02/08/grammys-take-a-serious-turn-with-domestic-violence-psa/23099075/>>.
- Washington, Arlene. "Grammys 2015: Sia Performs 'Chandelier' With Kristen Wiig (Video)." *Hollywoodreporter.com*. Web. 21 March 2015.  
<<http://www.hollywoodreporter.com/news/sia-grammys-video-performance-2015-771413>>.

# **GEMS (Gender, Education, Music, & Society)**

Volume 8, Number 4, April 2015

## **If Music Be The Food Of Love, Play On: Using Music As A Text To Explore Love In A Secondary English Classroom**

**Dani Goldstein, MA & Dr. Laraine Wallowitz**

© 2015 Dani Goldstein, danigoldstein211@gmail.com; Laraine Wallowitz, wallowitz@adelphi.edu  
Copyright Notice: The policy of GEMS is that authors will retain copyright to their materials.

**Abstract:** An English teacher in a secondary STEM school and her former English education professor collaborate on an article about their experience using music as a text to explore the concept of love in a secondary English classroom. Using the principles and practices of critical literacy and backwards design, the teachers broaden the notion of reading and writing to include non-print texts such as music to help students negotiate love and gender in Shakespeare's "Romeo and Juliet" and popular music. Students used the essential question, *How does love influence us?* as a framework for their investigation. Once students studied love and gender in the play and in popular music, the students synthesized their new understandings into their own song lyrics. The authors found that when the students were given the chance to read and write music, "great and untapped creative potential simmering inside" was "let out and given a chance to thrive."

### How Do Love And Music Influence Us?

I knew that I wanted to talk about love with my students. I wanted the entire unit to be devoted to the investigation of love—the different *kinds* of love, the way media and pop culture each portrays love, and—most importantly—the influences of love. That was our essential question: How does love influence us? It was there above the aim at the start of every lesson, it was there on our class discussion board (always a question that needed answering), and it was the first question that my students thought of whenever new case studies were introduced<sup>1</sup>. But we'll get to that in a minute.

I work as an English teacher in a small Queens high school where admission is based on the Specialized High School Admissions Test (SHSAT), which is very much like the SAT. We're the only school of our kind in Queens and we have an extremely small student population. Just over 400 students in total. We occupy one floor of a building on the campus of York College, and while space is always an issue, for this English teacher, the broader struggle is capturing the attention of kids who've come to our school because of its concentration on the sciences. From the moment they enter the building in freshman year, it's about doing all they can to get into the college of their dreams. When they're here because of an aptitude for math and science, that's predominantly where their focus and energy is channeled, so the idea of spending valuable time looking for the deeper meaning, the bigger idea, or the applicable messages is initially abhorrent.

Currently, this is my second year in the school, and I'm learning the ebbs and flows, quirks and traditions as I go along. High academic expectations are a given both from the teachers, as well as from the parents. We have a very high population of Asian and Middle Eastern students, almost all of whom come from a cultural background that brooks no argument with success. Which is part of why I felt it was so important to step back from the rigidity and regimentation and embark upon an exploration of the very aspect of their education that is often deemed less important until it's time to write the all-important college essay—humanity.

---

<sup>1</sup> For more on using big, "essential questions" to frame a unit of study, see Wiggins and McTigh *Understanding by Design* (1998).

When we began the unit, I explained to them that we weren't going to be doing the "Romeo and Juliet unit," or the "Ovid unit," or the "poetry unit." No; we were going to be investigating love using the evidence available to us (the various texts with which we worked). I explained that a *text*, despite how it may sound, was not limited to the written word; rather, it was any artifact that could be analyzed for meaning—a distinction that derived not just from my Adelphi education, but from my classes with Laraine Wallowitz herself. In *Youth Literacies: Literature, Culture and the Arts*, we learned how to read texts of all kinds—everything from the art and text of graphic novels or cereal boxes to the language and movement of bowling or dance. The blend and balance of traditional written texts and these other texts (as we have now come to understand them) enrich a classroom and engage learners of all types, skill levels, interests, and aptitudes. These artifacts were the aforementioned case studies, and they came in all shapes and sizes: short stories, excerpts from Ovid's *Metamorphosis*, poems, plays (*Oedipus*, *Antigone*, William Shakespeare's Star Wars, *Romeo & Juliet*, and *A Midsummer Night's Dream*), *Psychology Today* articles, popular music and music videos, and a special offshoot on domestic violence using Chris Brown and Rhianna as an entry point. Yes, a text is the product and arrangement of the written word, but we limit ourselves when we stop thinking that anything that doesn't use words in a customary fashion holds no value in an investigation of meaning. Music, in particular, both the arrangement of notes in the orchestration, as well as the lyrics (if they be present) makes for an incredibly rich text, and, as you will see, is made all the richer when expanding our analysis to music videos, as well. The integration of these alternative resources is what made this unit, and many others since its inception, a successful pedagogical experiment.

### Reading The Word And The World

The work from Laraine Wallowitz's class was inspired by her work in critical literacy. Critical literacy aims to challenge the status quo by disrupting commonplace notions of socially constructed concepts such as race, class, gender, and sexuality. The critical reader understands that *how* we read is as important as *what* we read and asks questions about the

construction of texts/knowledge and power relationships: Who is the intended audience? What is the hidden agenda? How does the text reflect and shape notions of power and privilege? What is included? What is excluded? How is the text trying to position the reader? As such, critical literacy interrogates texts in order to identify and challenge social constructs, ideologies, underlying assumptions, and power structures that intentionally and unintentionally perpetuate social inequalities and injustices.

Additionally, critical literacy invites reading “the word and the world” (Freire and Macedo, 1987). That is, critically reading both print and non-print texts such as media, music, art, and other sign systems students negotiate and subvert every day. Literate students in a post-modern world, wherein reality is understood to be socially and culturally constructed and all understandings highly contextualized, must be able to participate in a variety of literacy practices pulling from different sets of skills and discourses in order to read beyond the printed word.

The authors of the article suggest a more inclusive expansive notion of text offered by traditional literacy across the curriculum programs. We also argue that the narrowed definition of literacy – reading and writing the printed word – has often resulted in excluding marginalized populations by invalidating their home literacies and cultural identities. Today’s literacy teachers should think in terms of multiple literacies, including music as a text worthy of study, particularly from a feminist or gender lens.

### **Gender And Music**

Gender, while not explicitly the focus of the unit, became a reoccurring motif, a conversation piece to which the students kept returning time and time again. To get a handle on love, I asked the students to define it in their own words, noting that they would have to do so again at the end of the unit—the purpose, to see if their original ideas had changed or not. We got our feet wet by analyzing how psychology looks at love—those *Psychology Today* articles. Here, students debated the veracity of the claims made about how male and female reactions to love differ. Generally, guys hurt more, but keep it bottled up, while girls let it out—usually to their friends, to whom, the texts noted,

girls show more affection than their male counterparts. The results were varied, with some conversations splitting along gender lines, and others finding their most ardent debaters in the opposing sex. In trying to navigate the gender discussion, we realized we needed to map the boundaries first. I polled my students, asking questions about who had or hadn’t even heard certain phrases typically associated with men and women. Phrases such as “you throw like a girl,” “boys don’t cry,” “that’s man’s/woman’s work,” etc... My students reported having some of these said to them, while at the same time noting that there were others that they were more apt to hear because of their social, religious, and cultural background that so greatly differed from mine—the exceptionally *white* perspective from which these questions came. Of predominantly Asian and Middle Eastern descent, my students said they were more likely to hear things like “act like a man,” “act like a lady,” “respect your father/brother,” “be honorable,” etc... And then there were the biases in my perspective that came, not from race, but from a place my still-wet-behind-the-ears self had not even thought to take into account: my age. I focused on statements about girls being good at cooking and boys being good at sports. What I found?—boys are much more likely to be associated with video game prowess these days. Sports have taken a back seat to a “guy” being adept with a game console, controller, or role-play. And why not? These games are focused mainly on two things: being an epic hero locked in battle, or being a criminal set loose upon a city with a mandate to cause as much damage and destruction as possible.

In the latter, criminals are muscled, leathered, bling-wearing thugs armed to the teeth and surrounded by women only in two forms: victims or hookers. A woman in a role-playing game like that is either going to be beaten, raped, murdered, or is there to sell her body to the highest bidder.

In the former, students deconstructed those games (going back as far as Super Mario Brothers) to have a basic story and reward system that revolves around money (the acquisition of gold coins, gems, weapons, treasure, etc...) and the prize of a woman, usually the one around which the story (typically, a kidnapping) revolves. Students drew connections to a story we had read in a previous unit called “The Princess and All the Kingdom.” There, a prince comes

to a kingdom simply because he wishes to marry the princess. He wins her hand valiantly—with skills showcased in battle—and must ultimately take responsibility for the crown, the vault of jewels and gold, and the entire kingdom’s welfare (much to the prince’s chagrin). Here, the arguments made by the students surprised me: the girls were naturally indignant at the idea that a woman should be any sort of prize, that she should be forced to marry any man (even though in the story, the princess seems eager to marry—if only because of the sexual appeal attached to an alpha male), and that it should be this interloping prince who gets to rule a kingdom that should be rightfully the princess’s—it is *her* home, after all. The boys, for the most part, agreed with the points the girls were making, but kept coming back to another point: they kept wondering whether either of them really loved the other. I was surprised that it was the boys, and not the girls, who wondered with such heartfelt sincerity about the idea of true love, and upon that realization, admitted as much to my class—calling attention to my own gender bias in the process.

The title of the whole unit was inspired by a song from the ‘70s by a group called 10cc—“The Things We Do for Love.” It is that very song that kicks off the unit each time. Students preview the lyrics and then turn and talk about the mood and tone of the piece, as well as what themes are present with regard to the topic at hand: love. I find that having the students complete an initial reading and analysis of the text sans orchestration is helpful for scrutiny on multiple levels:

1. Students can begin their work with an artifact in a familiar form: words. They’re always going to look for what the text says to them explicitly, first, so it is beneficial to start off the discussion in a manner in which they’re exceedingly conversant.
2. Once the students have gleaned whatever explicit meaning they can, the conversation will naturally move towards the implicit suggestions, metaphorical language, and messages beneath the surface that they know are the next phase of investigation. Here is where students begin to opine on what they believe may be the case, asking and answering questions such as: What’s going

on with this couple? Is it actually a specific couple or is the song about relationships in general? And, of course, the question that both the title and the chorus conspire to get audiences to ask: What *are* the things we do for love? How far are we willing to go? And, as the essential question continually examines: How does love influence us?

3. When the students listen to the recording of the song with full accompaniment, the orchestration adds another layer of meaning and yields additional aspects of understanding. Students now have to ascertain whether or not the mood and tone of the full piece match what they determined to be the mood and tone of the lyrics. Furthermore, in analyzing mood and tone, they are dealing with the *aesthetics* of the piece and have to treat said aesthetics like character traits—all furthering their understanding of the character created by 10cc in the speaker of the song.

This process is the same method I use whenever I introduce a musical text into a unit: previewing the text for explicit and implicit meaning, determining mood and tone, questioning the text, discussing the possibilities, then introducing the full arrangement and repeating the process in comparison with the first-round conclusions. Students become accustomed to the process, as well as the questions to prompt analysis, and after repeated exercises, their academic interrogation of the music (on all levels) becomes second nature. The same was true of our other musical texts: John Mayer’s “Dreaming with a Broken Heart” and Train’s “When I Look to the Sky,” which link thematically with issues of love and loss (death); Taylor Swift’s “Love Story” and its allusions to *Romeo and Juliet*; and, of course, Eminem and Rihanna’s “Love the Way You Lie,” which introduces the topic of domestic violence, violence in relationships, the sexualization of violence, and how music videos allow for even more layers of meaning and facilitate increased levels of understanding.

I had them read and watch some of the press coverage of Chris Brown’s initial attack on Rihanna. They read through the entire history of their relationship as documented in the media. They read

and watched the follow-up interviews with both of them, and they discussed the issue of whether or not Chris Brown was really sorry, if he'd really be able to change, and if Rhianna was right to still love him and want to be with him.

We discussed the irony of Rihanna's life considering her collaboration with Eminem on "Love the Way You Lie" parts one and two. We watched the videos, read the lyrics, and discussed how it wasn't just one-sided abuse in the relationship they depicted. I asked them how the music was manipulating their mood, and how the editors of the video were doing the same. How are they attempting to influence you? They noted that the videos made the violence the basis of sexual appeal and attraction between the two—one moment he's throwing her against a wall violently and the next they're making out. They're lying in bed together peacefully, lovingly, then she sees evidence of another girl on his body and she lashes out violently before they're rolling around together in bed again. And then we looked at nationwide domestic violence statistics from where the most surprising lesson for them came: men are victims of domestic abuse, too. They are attacked, they are abused, and they, too, are victims, although not nearly as often as women. But men are less likely to report it. When I asked the class why men do not report rape as much as women, they came back at me with two very powerful answers: 1) who would believe them? 2) shame.

We analyzed the Red Jumpsuit Apparatus song "Face Down," which discusses an abusive male character and his, presumably, victimized girlfriend. Here is where the importance of orchestration, lyrics, message, and images all culminate in ultimate understanding. We discussed domestic violence as a nation-wide issue, and as it relates to teen relationships. We watched clips from ABC's *General Hospital* when it was featuring a storyline between a 17-year-old Kristina and her seemingly-perfect boyfriend Kiefer, who was, of course, abusing her. First emotionally (controlling her, manipulating her, verbally attacking her), and then physically—going so far as to put her in the hospital. Kristina's lies to cover for her abuser are extensive, and, as a result, the answers students gave to our essential question were bountiful and outraged. A fan-made video on YouTube juxtaposes the images of the aforementioned *General Hospital* storyline with the recording of the song.

Students discussed the images that came to mind for them when reading the lyrics, when hearing the song, and how they lined up with or differed from the images of the teen abuse featured on *General Hospital*.

### **From Reading To Writing Love And Lyrics**

And then I asked them to redefine love and prove it in one of many different possible projects—the most relevant of which, of course, was the opportunity to write and record an original song. I received 15 original musical compositions that varied in composition, lyrics, theme, style, and aesthetics.

In one class, two young women teamed up to write a love song that ended up inspiring a project of my own. One of the young women, let's call her Mia, is a talented musician (she plays guitar and piano), and the other, let's call her Dana, is an aspiring songwriter. Dana wanted to write an original love song badly, but found that she was limited because she can't write music—she's a lyricist. Mia stepped up to help her create a composition out of the goodness of her heart. She'd already completed her own musical composition with another song-writing team, but was so passionate about the topic and the music, that she jumped at the chance to compose another piece. Not only was the music wonderfully passionate and full of youthful ideas and narrative storytelling, but the energy of its composers shone through completely.

Xander, a young man who sat in my class all year long and very rarely spoke aloud to the whole class, came out of his shell completely during his project presentation. He wrote original music and lyrics, sang and recorded the song, and played it aloud in class. Not only were we seeing a side to Xander we had never before been given opportunity to set eyes on, but we learned what an incredibly beautiful singing voice he had, as well as the wonderfully quiet talent he possessed for music. Prior to this, I had only been privy to Xander's beautiful voice in the form of his writing: articulate arguments with clear ideas and a strong, distinct writer's voice. Hearing his actual voice so steadied during a time of obvious vulnerability was humbling for me as an educator. He had such a passion for the music that it overpowered his fear of public speaking. He based the song on an Anime series and talked about the perseverance of love, its strength, and power to withstand separation and distance. His high-soaring voice is accompanied only by a bare piano and

the “ping, ping, ping” of the keys and high notes create this otherworldly setting—which aligns with the series that inspired the piece. the chance to experience something again like it’s the first time. And that is worth everything.

Some boys banded together to create small hip hop groups. They’d lay down a beat, have a set of lyrics that told a story, and add some background instrumentals to boot. Other groups came together in orchestral quartets to compose and perform classical pieces and then explain how the aesthetics of the pieces proved their definitions of love true, as well as answered the essential question. They spoke of how the arrangement was written to create and manipulate mood—to make us feel, in some cases hopeful, and in others woefully pessimistic. Love was either an amazingly strong emotion that could survive and “lift us up where we belong” (to borrow some words from professional lyricists), or it was something for which we fought, but whose loss we had to fight to survive.

I even had a Christian folk group break out to create a quiet, catchy, near-pop-song quality tune with an accompanying music video. It was catchy, too! I and several other students could be found humming it in the hallways for days after. Here, though, the themes were softer and gentler—less melodramatic in the “life or death” of love, and more about the sweetness and innocence of holding hands and being around the other. For them, love was celebrated by just being in the other’s presence and being happy.

I was so thoroughly impressed with these young people whose musical talent is often limited, in a school of our small size and means, to the semi-annual school concerts. I could see then that there was a not-small population of our school that, despite (or maybe because of) our school’s focus on STEM subjects, there was a great and untapped creative potential simmering inside and nearly begging to be let out and given a chance to thrive.

Though I’d appreciated and relied on the versatility and universally topical nature of music to help further discussions, get the ball rolling, and open up avenues of discussion, I knew then that I had to provide more opportunities for music to thrive in my classroom, and specifically, for it to be created. Formal, informal, recorded, planned, or improv, music is a necessity in education because of what it provides for our children, but also because of what it allows our children to provide us: the ability to be surprised, and

## References

Freire, Paulo., & Macedo, Donald. (1987). *Literacy: Reading the word and the world*. South Hadley, MA: Bergin and Harvey.

# **GEMS (Gender, Education, Music, & Society)**

Volume 8, Number 4, April 2015

## **The Jodi Arias Saga: A Tragic Opera**

**Dr. Kristyan Kouri**

© 2015 Kristyan Kouri, [kristyan.m.kouri@csun.edu](mailto:kristyan.m.kouri@csun.edu)

Copyright Notice: The policy of GEMS is that authors will retain copyright to their materials.

**Abstract:** On June 4, 2008, 27-year-old Jodi Ann Arias murdered her lover, 30-year-old Travis Alexander. Demonized in the popular press, Arias is often depicted as a crazy jealous angry sociopath who had a fatal attraction toward a man who was largely indifferent to her. When her story is examined from a feminist perspective, the gendered sociological and psychological forces that influenced her decision to commit the brutal crime become apparent. The all-encompassing rage that fueled her violent action was at least partially the result of being used, degraded and held to a double standard by a man who, at first glance, seemed to be her prince charming. As such, Jodi Arias is not the monster she has been portrayed to be. Instead, her story can be likened to the most tragic of operas.

In June of 2013, Jodi Arias was convicted of killing her former lover, Travis Alexander. Because the jury deadlocked on whether she should be executed or sentenced to life in prison on two separate occasions, on April 13, 2014 judge Sherry Stephens will sentence Arias to either life in prison or life in prison with the eligibility of parole after 25 years. To say that this case has been sensational would be an understatement. Both trials garnered wide spread media coverage and three separate books have been written about the murder.

According to popular opinion, Jodi Arias is a jealous, crazy, angry sociopath who had a fatal attraction toward Alexander. When looks at the case from a feminist perspective, the story reads like a tragic opera. With that being said, I am not excusing Arias for the murder of Travis Alexander. What I instead hope to do is shed light on the gendered social and psychological forces that may have led a woman with no previous criminal history to engage in such a brutally violent action.

### **Act I**

In act one, we meet a twenty-six –year-old woman who would like to get married and have children, and at the same time is looking for jobs that will improve her financial situation. A high school dropout, she supports herself by working as a waitress. We also find that Arias is living with Darryl Brewer, a man twenty years her senior. Brewer admittedly has no interest in marrying Arias (Williams, 2013). The two are in the midst of losing the home they purchased together.

At this same time, Arias learns about Prepaid Legal, a company where employees make money selling legal plans. She attends a company conference and meets the dashing Travis Alexander. As a star motivational speaker for the company, he had been slated to attend a formal banquet the next evening. He invites Arias to be his date, and because she has nothing to wear, he finds her a gown.

One part of the banquet includes presentations given by star associates, which delineates their financial success with the company. Arias must have learned that Alexander owned a home in Mesa Arizona and that he drove a BMW. It is clear to me that Arias felt like she found her prince charming.

Nevertheless, Arias resists Alexander's sexual advances as she is still in a committed relationship with Darryl Brewer. Because Alexander seems intent on forming a relationship with her, and she is keen on exploring this option, she ends her partnership with Brewer soon thereafter. Arias makes it known that she hopes her romance with Alexander will lead to marriage.

### **Analysis Of Act I**

In act one, feminist themes are already evident. The fact that Arias was looking to marry and start a family children comes as no surprise as women living in contemporary society are still taught that their lives cannot be complete unless they form a long-lasting romantic partnership with a male. Young girls are bombarded with this message from toddlerhood on. They learn about it directly family and friends and indirectly by way of movies, popular songs and fairy tales such as Cinderella and Snow White. As such, the ability to attract men becomes incorporated in a woman's self-concept, and romantic rejection is often experienced as an assault to one's self-esteem.

Because narratives such as these can serve to shape a woman's point of view, and guide her behavior, as girls grow to adulthood, finding a husband (or a close equivalent such as a live-in boyfriend) becomes a primary objective. Securing a mate is, of course, not a young woman's only cultural objective as females living in America and other developed countries are now expected to attain some sort of career. Marriage to a successful is the culminating event in a whole host of cultural trajectories and many women still hope to meet this societal goal.

### **Act II**

In Act Two we watch the progression of the couples' relationship. Because Arias really wants to please Alexander, she takes instruction in the Mormon faith, and is eventually baptized into the religion by Alexander himself. It takes a while for Alexander to fully commit to Arias, but for about five months they are an official couple.

During this time period Arias begins to speak like Alexander and use his rhetorical quotes on her My Space page. When she is with him, she follows him from room to room, scrolls through his text messages, and listens in on his private conversations. When

Alexander is not in her physical presence, she talks about him incessantly.

Alexander's friends refer to Arias' behavior as strange and crazy. They come to the overall conclusion that she is "off." Although they warn Alexander about her, he insists that she is truly a nice and kind person.

### **Analysis Of Act II**

At first glance, Arias' actions do seem out of the ordinary. When her actions are examined through the use of a feminist lens, one begins to see that her behaviors are not necessarily so unusual after all. It appears that Arias was simply following a cultural trajectory so amply put by sociologist Rose Weitz. "Women," she writes, "are taught that they cannot live happy fulfilled lives without a Prince Charming who is superior to them in all ways" (Weitz, 1995, p. 450). In this way, it appears that Arias looked up to Alexander and wanted to be just like him. After all, Alexander was a successful and charming businessman and there was no one else like him in her social sphere. In addition, Arias is certainly not the first woman in the world to mold herself into the kind of person that she thought the man of her dreams wanted her to be.

There was a second issue probably going on as well. While the fact that Arias seems as though she is becoming Alexander seems strange, her behaviors are in keeping with what sociologist and psychoanalyst commonly happens to females when they enter into romantic relationships (Chodorow, 1978). Working from a branch of psychology known as the object relation's perspective, Chodorow contends that when babies are born, they see themselves as one with their mothers. As they grow older, children gradually learn that they are separate individuals. In doing so, they develop ego boundaries.

At the beginning of this developmental process, girls and boys want to be just like their mothers. Since anything seen as feminine is devalued in American society, mothers panic when their sons begin to engage in "feminine" actions. As a consequence, mothers push their sons away before they are ready to sever their close ties with their primary caregiver. For little boys, this abrupt and painful split causes them to develop very rigid ego boundaries, and they come to see themselves as completely separate from others.

When little girls begin to act their mothers, they are playing their proper gender roles and so mothers

do not become frightened. Yet when it comes to forming an identity separate from one's mother, little girls experience a different set of problems. Because the girls' primary caregiver is her mother, she may never form a completely individual identity. All told, women's ego boundaries are often diffuse and they may not see themselves as separate from others. Taken as a whole, Chodorow's theory can be used to explain why it seemed as though Arias was "becoming" Alexander.

A passage from Actress Angelica Huston's autobiography, Watch Me, provides us with another example of this phenomenon. After breaking up with a long-term boyfriend, she wrote the following passage in her diary. "I didn't know what was me and what wasn't anymore . . . I'd been Bob's possession and his construct, saying the things he might say, even smoking his brand of cigarettes" (Huston, 1994, p.9).

Nevertheless, Arias' behaviors appear to be at extreme end of the continuum and she may indeed be suffering from some kind of mental disorder. In this regard, a number of researchers have shown that a person's quest to meet rigid gender rules and roles can lead to a number of different psychopathologies. Although such works are too numerous to expound upon in this short essay, I will mention several of them here. In her bestselling book Reviving Ophelia, Psychologist Mary Pipher reported that many girls who were fine as children began to develop psychopathologies when they entered into their teens. Placing the blame for such maladies squarely on the back of cultural rules for women, Pipher notes that as girls move from childhood to adolescence, they are expected to follow harmful social directives. One such mandate has to do with physical appearance and girls are induced to spend an inordinate amount of time perfecting their looks. This, of course takes time away from healthier pursuits such as sports, study and other creative activities. In an attempt to fit in with their peers, girls follow these rules even though they know the rules are damaging. As such, they replace their true needs with false ones, and the suppression of their true needs gives rise to all sorts of psychological disorders (Pipher, 1994).

Other social scientists have examined the ways in which gender roles impact adult women. In an inquiry into the lives of married females diagnosed with schizophrenia in the 1950s, sociologist Carol Warren

discovered that the women's psychiatric symptoms were imbued with gender symbolisms relating to their husbands and children. One woman, for example, tried to burn her house down and another woman fed her child a tranquilizer pill. After conducting a careful analysis of their life stories, Warren concluded that mid-century gender rules, which relegated women to the domestic sphere, served to incite feelings of powerlessness, loneliness, stress and isolation. As time went on, she theorized, their feelings morphed into more serious psychiatric ailments (Warren, 1987).

These studies demonstrate that different types of gender rules can lead to a variety of mental illnesses as women have diverse life- circumstances and varying vulnerabilities. The pathological anger, which undoubtedly prompted Arias to murder her lover, is just one of the many maladaptive responses humans sometimes display when they find it impossible to meet society's rigid gender norms. Other psychological disorders that have been directly linked to peoples' failure to realize these goals include eating disorders, nervous breakdowns, and even suicide.<sup>2</sup>

### Act III

After about five months as an official pair, both Arias and Alexander mutually decide that their relationship needs to end. For Arias, Alexander's inability to be faithful is quite troublesome. However, they continue to communicate on a daily basis and Arias cannot let go of her dream of marrying and starting a family with him. So she decides to move from California to Mesa Arizona to be closer to Alexander.

Though Alexander tells his friends he is unhappy about Arias' plans and that she irritates him, he helps become familiarized with her new surroundings. He pays her to clean his home, and allows her to sneak into his house and sleep with him at night. The couple continues to take trips together, just as they had when they were an official couple.

Meanwhile, Alexander is openly looking for a chaste Mormon wife and he begins to date Lisa, an 18-year-old woman who is 11 years his junior. The fact that he is sleeping with Jodi and continuing to take

trips with her is kept secret from most of his friends. Arias suspects Alexander and Lisa are dating, but he tells Jodi that they are only friends. Lisa also suspects that Alexander is cheating on her with Jodi, because he talks about Jodi so much (Lohr, nd.).

On two occasions Alexander's tires are slashed while he is with Lisa, and on a third occasion, her tires are lacerated. Lisa suspects that Jodi is the culprit, but Alexander refused to believe that Arias would engage in such behavior. Alexander breaks up with Lisa and attempts to take up with another Mormon woman, 29-year-old Marie. He tells Jodi that he feels God wants Mimi to be his future wife and he also tells her the truth about his relationship with Lisa. Because Jodi now realizes that the situation is hopeless and that she and Alexander will never marry, she returns home to California.

### Analysis Of Act III

In Act III, a number of gender issues become apparent. First, since Arias clearly suspected that Lisa was Alexander's official girlfriend, and was cognizant of the fact that their sexual relationship was a secret, one wonders just why she would stay in the relationship? I believe that Arias was convinced that Alexander would eventually come to see her as that special one and would ultimately end his relationships with this other woman and marry her. In spite of the changes made as a result of the women's liberation movement, American women are still taught that a prime way to attract a man is through their sexual attractiveness. Therefore, the strategy Arias used to "hang onto" her prince charming was no different than the tactics employed by scores of other women trying to achieve this very same goal.

Second, although Arias was a willing participant in this love triangle, at some level, Arias had to have known she was degrading herself. It is therefore logical to wonder why a person would remain in a situation where she was at the bottom of her lover's relationship hierarchy. Once again, the probable answer comes from Sociologist Rose Weitz. "In their struggle to keep their men," she writes, "women learn to view one another as untrustworthy competitors" (Weitz, 1995).

It seems to me that Arias saw herself as part of a competition that she could definitely win, and that her willingness to have sex with Alexander would

<sup>2</sup> Although the root causes of Anorexia are subject to debate, the symptoms of the disease are certainly intertwined with cultural standards for beauty.

ultimately give her the competitive edge. However, this became an exercise in futility, for instead of drawing him closer to her, he instead came to look at her with disdain.

Third, it is easy to see that Arias' jealousy didn't just rise up out of thin air as many people in the media have suggested. No matter what he told his friends, Alexander and Arias *were* a couple. Although much has been made of Arias' fatal attraction to Alexander, little has been made of his fatal attraction to her. When it comes to their drama, he was very much a willing participant.

#### Act IV

Even after Arias returns home to California, she and Alexander continue to communicate with each other on a daily basis. He tells her he'll come for a visit. Their conversations become erotic and they even had phone sex. However, they also continue to argue and Arias feels that Alexander is becoming increasingly mean. In one text message he calls her a "three holed wonder" and tells her that she is at least "good for something" (Duke, 2014).

Arias and Alexander are scheduled to travel to Cancun together to tour the nearby Mayan ruins, but Travis tells Jodi he wants to go alone. What he doesn't tell Jodi is that he has invited Mimi to be his traveling companion and she has accepted. Jodi will later discover the truth.

During this period of time Arias logs into Alexander's Facebook page, and he becomes extremely upset that she has violated his privacy. A few weeks later they have another fight, though no one is sure what caused it, Travis does state that Arias did something so horrible that it left him in emotional ruin. He confronts Arias with a series of verbal denunciations. He calls her evil, a sociopath, a slut and a whore. He goes on to tell her that she's the worst thing that ever happened to him.

Eight days later, Arias visits Alexander at his home in Mesa Arizona. They spend the afternoon having sex. She kills him in the early evening. The murder is brutal. She stabs him 24 times, slits his throat, and shoots him in the forehead.<sup>3</sup>

<sup>3</sup> A lot happens after the murder. For one, Arias goes on to tell a series of lies in an attempt to get herself out of trouble. Her sentence would not have been so severe if she had initially come

#### Analysis Of Act VI

Arias had to have been cognizant of the fact that Alexander held her to a double standard. On the one hand, he saw Arias as tainted despite the fact that he willingly slept with her. On the other hand, he felt that he himself was worthy of a "virtuous" Mormon wife. So being called a whore provoked feelings of both anger and pain. When Alexander includes invectives such as sociopath and liar to this verbal assault, the rage that had been smoldering within her rose to the surface. It is at this point in time that Arias appears to have snapped.<sup>4</sup>

The murder itself is consistent with gendered crime patterns. In her research on women who kill, sociologist Vickie Jensen discovered that when women kill, they usually take the life of people who reside in their domestic sphere such as a husband or boyfriend (Jensen, 2001). The precipitating event is often an argument that is coupled with physical/emotional abuse. While men commit far more murders than do women, and these murders can occur in the context of their domestic sphere, sociological research shows that males are far more likely than females to kill for economic gain. This comes as no surprise as American gender rules for men continue to equate status with wealth and power.

The Arias case fits the pattern that Jensen and other criminologists describe. She did not murder Alexander for money. Though Arias claims that on the day of the murder, she accidentally dropped Alexander's brand new camera and a violent confrontation ensued, her veracity has been repeatedly questioned on this point. The evidence does, however, show that Alexander was, at least, emotionally abusive. All told, it appears that Arias felt victimized and degraded by the man she initially thought would be her prince charming, and murdered Alexander in a state of rage.

As such, the contours of the case are similar to another sensational crime of passion that garnered widespread media coverage—that of Dr. Anna Maria

---

clean. The murder trial in itself is a media spectacle. These events make for another story.

<sup>4</sup> After reviewing these text messages, Dr. L.C. Miccio Fonseca, sexual relationship expert and witness for the defense, stated that at this point in time, Arias was in extreme emotional distress.

Gonzalez-Angulo – a woman who was convicted of aggravated assault for poisoning her lover, Dr. George Blumenchein, with a sweet tasting chemical found in antifreeze on September 29, 2014 (Rogers, 2014). Similar to Arias, Gonzalez-Angulo found herself at the bottom of lover's relationship hierarchy as Blumenchein had a live-in girlfriend while maintaining a sexual relationship with Anna Maria. Like Arias, Gonzalez-Angulo had no history of violence and no prior arrest record. In the end, the intense emotional turmoil that accompanied these love affairs gone-bad seems to be what triggered the violent behaviors exhibited by both women (Kouri, 2014).

Of course these situations did not give either woman the right to assault or murder their lovers, and it should be noted that the vast majority of women that experience the feelings of anger that arises after being scorned do not resort to violence. Nevertheless, in some rare instances, the hurt and rage that emerges after romantic rejection, coupled with the inability to meet powerful gender norms for marriage and family, can ultimately lead some women to commit unspeakable acts of brutality.

Arias' unspeakable act of brutality has led many journalists to assert that she is a sociopath. For example, in the last chapter of the Arias biography, *Picture Perfect: The Jody Arias Story*, author Shanna Hogan uses the word sociopath to describe her character (Hogan, 2013, p.336). Although I have never met Arias, and as such, cannot make any kind of definitive diagnosis, after reviewing the evidence at hand, my training in both sociology and psychology has led me to conclude that she is anything but. In addition to the analytic points I make earlier in this paper, I will now turn to the work of psychologists Neil Jacobson and John Gottman to give further credence to this point of view.

After carefully examining the issue of domestic violence in their book, *When Men Batter Women*, Jacobson and Gottman conclude that men who batter women fall into two different camps (Jacobson & Gottman, 1998). One type of batterer referred to as a "pitbull", is a man completely emotionally dependent on his wife or girlfriend. The "pitbull" is the type of batterer who continues to obsess about and even stalk his wife or girlfriend long after they have ended their relationship.

"Cobras" by contrast, are a group of men who

have a long history of antisocial behavior and are generally unable to hold down a job. Jacobson and Gottman assert that some of the men that fall into this category are true sociopaths. Since this type of batterer is incapable of forming any kind of true connection with their wives or girlfriends, they only form attachments with females to secure economic benefits, social rewards and sexual gratification. If the relationship should end, the "cobra" quickly moves on to his next target. Hence, if Arias were a true sociopath, she would not have become so attached to Alexander and she would not have held onto him for so long.

In an article he penned for *Psychology Today*, Psychiatrist Dale Archer M.D. also asserts that Arias cannot be defined as a sociopath, though he qualifies this statement by making it clear that he has never met Arias and can only offer his opinion rather than make an official diagnosis (Archer, 2013). He begins by noting that the term, "sociopath" is nothing other than a "lay term for the psychiatric diagnosis *antisocial personality disorder*." He then goes on to compare what he's learned about Arias to the DSM IV diagnostic criteria for *antisocial personality disorder*. Although some parts of the diagnostic criteria do seem to correspond to what is known about Arias, he maintains that her story does not match the most important part of the criteria: She did not display antisocial behaviors in her teen years. Archer writes that Arias had, "no prior behavioral issues, legal issues, problems with work, family or friends [and] no known problems with previous boyfriends."

Information gleaned from Arias' former boyfriend Darryl Brewer corroborates Dr. Archer's assertion. In an interview he gave to AZ Central, Brewer told news correspondents that before becoming involved with Prepaid Legal and the Mormon Church, Arias was a kind, sensitive and caring person who was wonderful with his son (Williams, nd.). He reported that she was good with her friends and would go bowling with her restaurant coworkers on a weekly basis. Brewer also told the AZ Central newscasters that Arias was very hard working. After working two different jobs she had managed to save \$12,000. "She wasn't taking me for a ride," he stated, "Because I didn't have any money... I don't know what happened to her in that last year-and-a-half, but something changed radically."

In the end, it is important to remember that Arias is a young woman from a working class background who spent most of her adult life working as a waitress. At the time of the murder, she did not even have a high school diploma. It is also evident that she had not been politicized in any way and, in effect, did not have any kind of feminist consciousness. With that being said, I wish she had been in a position to take a gender and women's studies course so she would have learned to deconstruct gender rules and roles. In this way, she may have been able to develop an understanding as to why she was so drawn to Alexander, and why she had such a hard time letting go of a man who treated her so poorly. For if she had greater insights into the way she was feeling, she may have been able to stop herself from committing the heinous crime that ruined her entire life.

## References

- Lohr, David. (2014, November 20). Travis Alexander Never Loved Jodi Arias, Expert Testifies: Inside Their 'Below The Waist' Relationship. Huffington Post. Retrieved from [http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2013/01/30/jodi-arias-trial-lisa-andrews-diadoni-\\_n\\_2584089.html](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2013/01/30/jodi-arias-trial-lisa-andrews-diadoni-_n_2584089.html)
- Archer, Dale. (2013) Is Jodi Arias a Sociopath? Retrieved from <https://www.psychologytoday.com/blog/reading-between-the-headlines/201303/is-jodi-arias-sociopath>
- Chodorow, Nancy (1978). The reproduction of mothering. Psychoanalysis and the sociology of gender. (1978) Oakland, CA: The University of California Press.
- Hogan, Shanna. (2013). Picture perfect, The Jodi Arias story. New York, NY: Martin's Press.
- Huston, Angelica. (2014). Watch me: A memoir. New York, NY: Scribner.
- Jacobson, Neil. & Gottman, John. (1998). When Men Batter Women: New Insights into Ending Abusive Relationships. New York, NY: Simon & Schuster.
- Jensen, Vickie. (2001). Why Women Kill: Homicide and Gender Equality. Boulder, CO: Lienne Rienner Publishers.
- Kouri, Kristyan. (2014). Love Affair Gone Bad Leads to Violence: The Gonzalez-Angulo Story. *Journal of Sociology and Criminology*. Retrieved from <http://esciencecentral.org/journals/love-affair-gone-bad-leads-to-violence-the-gonzalezangulo-story-2375-4435.1000112.pdf>
- Lohr, David. (2013, January, 30). Travis Alexander's Ex-Girlfriend Lisa Andrews Diadoni Testifies In Jodi Arias Trial." Huffington Post. Retrieved from [http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2013/01/30/jodi-arias-trial-lisa-andrews-diadoni-\\_n\\_2584089.html](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2013/01/30/jodi-arias-trial-lisa-andrews-diadoni-_n_2584089.html)
- Pipher, Mary. (1994). Reviving Ophelia: Saving the Selves of Adolescent Girls. New York, NY: Ballantine Books.
- Rogers, Brian. (2014, September 26). Convicted of Killing her Colleague turned Lover, MD Anderson Doc Awaits Punishment. Huffington Post. Retrieved from [http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2013/01/30/jodi-arias-trial-lisa-andrews-diadoni-\\_n\\_2584089.html](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2013/01/30/jodi-arias-trial-lisa-andrews-diadoni-_n_2584089.html)
- Warren, Carol. (1987). Madwives: Schizophrenic Women in the 1950s. Mountain View, CA: Rutgers University Press.
- Weitz, Rose. (1995). Social reactions to lesbians, spinsters, widows and nuns. In Freeman, Jo. (Ed). *Women a Feminist Perspective*. Mountain View, CA: Mayfield Publishing Company. P.450
- Williams, Chris. (2013, May 20). Jodi Arias' ex-boyfriend says what he couldn't in court. Retrieved from <http://archive.azcentral.com/12news/articles/20130520jodi-arias-darryl-brewer-interview.html>

# **GEMS (Gender, Education, Music, & Society)**

Volume 8, Number 4, April 2015

## **Women Music Educators In The United States: A History. By Sondra Wieland Howe**

Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press, Inc. 2014, 380 pp.  
Hardback \$75.00 US (£44.95), eBook \$74.99 US (£44.95)

**Dr. Sondra Wieland Howe**

© 2015 Sondra Wieland Howe, howex009@umn.edu

Copyright Notice: The policy of GEMS is that authors will retain copyright to their materials.

*Women Music Educators* is a comprehensive narrative of women teaching music in the United States from colonial days until the end of the twentieth century. Traditional accounts of the history of music education have often neglected the contributions of women, because these texts have emphasized bands and the top leaders in hierarchical music organizations. When music education is defined broadly, the contributions of many forgotten women are revealed. Women taught in many settings: the home,

community, churches, public schools, and teacher-training institutions. Women were music educators as writers, patrons, and through their volunteer work in organizations. Their stories are found in articles, dissertations, and books from the fields of musicology, education, and social history.

This book describes women music educators' experiences throughout the United States and in many national organizations, then includes narratives and photos from Minnesota, where the author has taught

for many years. The Introduction reviews literature from the history of music education, history of education, and musicology to give a background for writing the history of women in music education. The book includes an extensive Bibliography (pages 311-22), an Index (323-35), and sixteen pages of photos.

Part I: Early American Music Education to 1860. Women had the responsibility for educating children to become moral and virtuous citizens. Most education took place in the family, although there were “dame schools” for children. Colonial household inventories list a variety of instruments in homes. Women attended singing schools to learn music. Some women attended academies where music was an “accomplishment” along with dancing and painting.

By the early nineteenth century, women published compositions and published many hymn texts. Emma Willard founded the Troy Female Seminary to train teachers. Women taught music in private academies, Sunday Schools, and rural schoolhouses. Women were successful as organists in major Boston churches and taught keyboard lessons privately.

Part II: Civil War and the Late Nineteenth Century (1860-1900). In the second half of the nineteenth century, public school systems expanded and included normal schools. The roles of women were changing through the suffrage movement, new opportunities in professions, and the founding of many clubs and organizations. In the private sphere, women continued to perform and teach in the home, write hymn texts, and publish compositions. The World’s Columbian Exposition of 1893 showcased the accomplishments of women in many areas of music.

In the public sphere, women supervised music in urban school systems, developed kindergartens, and published songbooks. Julia Crane founded the first institution to train music specialists for the public schools. Women studied and taught in normal schools, summer institutes, and conservatories. Many music organizations were established in the late nineteenth century. At local music clubs, women performed, created programs for students, and organized concert series for the public. The Music Teachers National Association (est. 1876) included independent teachers of voice and piano plus public school teachers. The NEA Department of Music Education involved women as committee members, performers, and speakers.

Part III: Twentieth Century through World War II (1900-1945). By the turn of the century, the need for youth labor decreased in agriculture and industry, and more young people entered public high schools. Immigration also increased the school population. Teacher-training programs expanded. Women had more opportunities to work in the public sphere by the 1920s. The decade of the 1930s brought unemployment for many, but new employment opportunities developed during World War II. During the expansion of the public school system in the first half of the twentieth, foundations for modern music education were formed with expanded offerings in band, orchestra, choir, and music appreciation.

Women became music supervisors in large urban school systems. In 1907, music teachers and supervisors met in Keokuk, Iowa, in a group that became the Music Supervisors National Conference (MSNC). Frances Elliott Clark was the first president of MSNC and several women were president in the early years. In public schools, classroom piano was popular, with women writing the materials for these new courses. With the demand for textbooks in public schools, women published music textbook series (Eleanor Smith, M. Teresa Armitage, Mabelle Glenn, Lilla Bell Pitts) and piano methods (Angela Diller and Elizabeth Quaille, Leila Fletcher).

In the field of music appreciation, Frances Elliott Clark developed materials through the Victor Talking Machine Company, Alice Keith taught music appreciation on the radio in Cleveland, Marguerite Hood worked on radio programs for rural Montana, and Anne Shaw Faulker Oberndorfer gave lectures on the radio in Chicago. Women developed music appreciation programs in the black community of Washington, D.C. through the Coleridge-Taylor Choral Society.

With the growth of instrumental music in schools, girls studied band and orchestra instruments and became orchestra teachers. When women were denied positions in major symphony orchestras, they created women’s orchestras. Women played in mandolin ensembles and town bands early in the twentieth century. By World War II, they had new opportunities to play in university bands and the military bands of the Women’s Army Corps, Coast Guard SPARS, Marine Corps, and the Navy WAVES.

Urban settlement house music schools provided opportunities for children to learn an instrument and appreciate quality music. Women were very involved in the settlement house movement. Eleanor Smith founded the Hull House Music School in Chicago. In New York City, music schools were established at Henry Street Settlement, Greenwich House, the Third Street Music School Settlement, and the Union Neighborhood Music School, and some of these schools still exist.

In the area of teacher training and higher education, women first studied in summer music institutes, then normal schools, which became teachers' colleges in the 1920s. Women founded several conservatories: Clara Bauer founded Cincinnati Conservatory, San Francisco Conservatory evolved from Ada Clement and Lillian Hodghead's music school, Mary Louise Curtis Bok founded the Curtis Institute of Music in Philadelphia, and Harriet Gibbs Marshall the Washington (D.C.) Conservatory of Music.

Part IV: Since World War II (1945 to 2000). The period from 1945 to 1960 was a conservative time when women were encouraged to return to their lives as full-time wives and mothers. Women's roles gradually changed by the 1960s with feminist movements and legislation, especially Title IX. MENC responded to demands for reform through various projects and symposiums.

The new methodologies of Dalcroze, Orff, Kodály, and Suzuki were all founded by men, but were developed and promoted by women. Emile Jaques-Dalcroze developed eurhythmics, or the Dalcroze method, in Switzerland. In the United States, women created Dalcroze training programs that spread the method internationally. Carl Orff developed his method with Dorothee Günther and other women in Germany. Doreen Hall created Orff materials in Canada and many women have been involved in the American Orff-Schulwerk Association. Zoltán Kodály developed his method in Hungary. Many American women studied in Hungary and founded the Organization of American Kodály Educators. The Japanese violinist, Shinichi Suzuki created his method, while his wife Waltraud Prange, from Germany, translated for him and organized his international travels.

Despite the promotion of feminist ideas in the United States since 1960, there were only three women presidents of MENC from 1950 to 1992: Marguerite Hood, Frances M. Andrews, and Mary E. Hoffman. From 1992 to 2010, half of the presidents were women, and women have been active at state and local levels. Vanett Lawler was involved in the administration of MENC from 1942 to 1968. She was also a driving force in the founding of ISME (International Society for Music Education). MTNA, an organization of independent and college music teachers, included many female members, but did not select a woman president until 1970. In contrast, the National Federation of Music Clubs (est. 1898) has only had female national presidents (1898-1995) and female state presidents (1921-2011). Band organizations have not been receptive towards women members or female leadership.

Music textbooks since 1950 have been published with several editors per series, including many women. Women have gradually joined the editorial boards of national journals and edited research handbooks. While women have found their places as orchestra conductors, band directors, performers in symphonies, leaders in organizations, there are still many gender issues that need to be discussed to understand the role of women in American music education.

In conclusion, there are many opportunities for new research on women music educators. This book includes stories of outstanding African-American educators, but more research is needed on all ethnic groups. The book describes women on the national scene and examples of educators in Minnesota, but work is needed on all areas of the country, especially the far West. This book will complement the current histories of music education and should be of interest to scholars in many fields.

## Reference

Howe, Sondra Wieland. (2014). *Women Music Educators In The United States: A History*. Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press, Inc.