*New Idea***Phylogeny can inform animal model development for both inherited and induced conditions: Duchenne Muscular Dystrophy (DMD) and Fetal Alcohol Spectrum Disorders (FASD)****Mason B. Meers¹, Nora Egan Demers, Audra Hewett, and Dakota Sorrelle**

Mason B. Meers (mmeers@ut.edu), Department of Biology, College of Natural & Health Sciences, The University of Tampa, 401 Kennedy Blvd., Tampa, FL, USA 33606-1490

Nora Egan Demers (ndemers@fgcu.edu), Department of Biological Sciences, College of Arts & Sciences, Florida Gulf Coast University, 10501 FGCU Blvd., Fort Myers, FL, USA 33965

Audra Hewett (drahewett292@gmail.com), Department of Biology, College of Natural & Health Sciences, The University of Tampa, 401 W. Kennedy Blvd., Tampa, FL, USA 33606-1490 and Next Generation Chiropractic, 8390 Champions Gate Blvd., Suite 315, Champions Gate, FL, USA 33896-8311

Dakota Sorrelle (dakota.sorrelle@spartans.ut.edu), Department of Biology, College of Natural & Health Sciences, The University of Tampa, 401 W. Kennedy Blvd., Tampa, FL 33606-1490

Abstract

The use of animal models in research on human and veterinary diseases and disorders is retracting, though it is likely to remain critical for decades. In light of increasing regulation and expectations of judicious use of animal subjects, we examine the idea that the use of animal models can be guided by phylogenetic relationships and modern evolutionary and cladistic analyses. Given that inherited disorders, and indeed, even the developmental and physiological responses to non-inherited conditions, are subject to evolutionary forces, it follows that the observed differences in model organisms are the products of evolutionary divergence. Understanding that divergence has the potential to elucidate which taxa are most likely to exhibit any given symptom or manifest a reaction in a broadly predictable fashion. We examine two case studies, one the inherited disorder Duchenne Muscular Dystrophy, and the other an entirely environmentally induced problem, Fetal Alcohol

Spectrum Disorder, or Fetal Alcohol Syndrome. Both case studies reveal symptoms are largely congruent with phylogeny, suggesting relatively conservative evolution of developmental pathways. It follows that it is possible to characterize the manifestation of symptoms or dysmorphologies to broad phylogenetic groups. These data can then be used to inform research into possible treatments based on molecular genetic techniques sourced from unaffected taxa or even provide an evolutionary rationale for maximizing ethical decisions in the use and development of animal models in biomedical research. We argue that the technique should become standard practice in the development of animal models.

Keywords: phylogeny, model animals, evolutionary medicine, Duchenne Muscular Dystrophy (DMD), Fetal Alcohol Spectrum Disorders (FASD), Fetal Alcohol Syndrome (FAS)

¹ Corresponding author

Introduction

The utility of animal models in biomedical research has been questioned by researchers across a broad range of fields (Johnson et al. 1999, Hegen et al. 2008, Wall and Shani 2008, Nestler and Hyman 2010, Pound and Ritskes-Hoitinga 2018), based on the high failure rate of animal models to successfully predict therapeutic results in target species (Wall and Shani 2008), or based on questions of validity more generally (Nestler and Hyman 2010, Pound and Ritskes-Hoitinga 2018). By their very nature, animal models represent evolutionary lineages that have been divergent from their target species (typically our own or those of veterinary interests) for millions to hundreds of millions of years. Thus, the premise that responses might yield adequate predictions of the target species is predicated on the conservation of not just genes, but of homologous processes including differential splicing, developmental cascades, and more. Pound and Ritskes-Hoitinga (2018), for example, conclude that failure in animal model development is predominantly due to species-level differences between model organisms and their target species, though Willmann et al (2009) are more optimistic about the value of existing models, particularly with more critical analyses and improved characterization of disease states in model species.

It remains unclear; however, if the predominance of failure is an intrinsic problem or one that's due to the haphazard nature of developing animal models. Indeed, animal models for diseases and genetic disorders have proliferated across taxa so broadly as to seem nearly random. Duchenne Muscular Dystrophy (DMD), for example, has no fewer than 12 species used as model organisms due in part to such things as accidental discoveries of putatively homologous conditions (e.g., in several breeds of domestic dog). For Fetal Alcohol Spectrum Disorder (FASD) numerous species have been used in experimental contexts to assess the effects of ethanol exposure during development, ranging from fruit flies to Macaques, and similar situations exist for many other diseases and conditions.

In recent years it has become increasingly clear that the complexity with which developmental and biochemical pathways ultimately produce normal- and dysmorphologies (physical or physiological) in the phenotype is simply unaccounted for in typical model animal research (Richtsmeier et al. 2000), and may be the cause of many failures during clinical trials (Wall and Shani 2008). Much research on dysmorphology is framed in the context of clarifying the roles of individual genes or molecules, though as Reeves and colleagues have argued in the case of Down Syndrome, the ultimate phenotypic expression is likely the result of genetic, environmental, and stochastic influences (Reeves et al. 2001). More importantly, given that any one gene

product may interact with numerous other gene products in the development of phenotype, mutations in one gene product may have wide ranging effects on phenotype (Richtsmeier et al. 2000), particularly amongst taxa that have been divergent for millions of years, accumulating autapomorphic mutations in interacting gene products. In other words, while a gene of interest (e.g., for Duchenne Muscular Dystrophy) may be homologous amongst model organisms, not only has this gene itself been subject to mutation and divergence for tens of millions of years since its last common ancestor with a model, but all of the genes with which it interacts have been as well. The result likely manifests itself in the inconsistent phenotypic response to insults seen in animal model studies (see Richtsmeier et al. 2000).

An ideal heuristic animal model for disease would need to not only possess the causal factor for the disease (e.g., a mutation), but also homologous and unaltered genes for every gene that interacts with that cause. As these conditions are unlikely to be met in any model other than conspecifics, sister taxa logically make the next best possible model organism, which in the case of humans is of course the chimpanzee (Lockwood et al. 2004, Uddin et al. 2004), so presenting numerous ethical concerns and difficulties (Knight 2008). But the choice of appropriate animal model cannot rest upon which organism is most likely to have the most conserved developmental pathways, as the answer would always be the same for each target species, but rather should be one of determining which of the available animal models conserves pathways that are of use in solving particular problems. Willmann et al (2009) provide an exceptional review of several DMD mammalian models that approach this goal by providing a comparative analysis of symptoms across models, though not explicitly in an evolutionary context. If we can assess to what extent the manifestations found in model organisms are likely to be homologous, then we may better predict which model organisms might make the best positive or negative models for specific traits or symptoms.

In any disease process, the response of the body to the disease is a product of evolution, with the diversity of responses across taxa reflective of the time since the diversification of those taxa. Shared, homologous responses to disease were discussed by Charles Darwin (Darwin 1871) in the context of non-human primate responses to medications originally developed for humans. In so far as medical treatments for humans result in comparable responses in non-humans, successful treatment indicates that the affected systems evolved their relevant functional structures or physiology before the two taxa diverged. That is, the treatment has the same effect on the non-human system because the system affected is primitive to both taxa. It follows then that divergence in systems affected by disease should logically result in divergence of symptoms or

manifestations of the disease and possibly in responses to treatment, likely at least part of the cause of failures in animal testing of medicines.

We explore the feasibility of using the Cladistic methodology known as character optimization, or trait mapping, to examine the evolution of a genetic disorder, Duchenne Muscular Dystrophy (DMD), as well as the non-inherited insult to development known as Fetal Alcohol Spectrum Disorder (FASD).

Duchenne Muscular Dystrophy (DMD)

Muscular dystrophy is a term that encompasses several hereditary diseases characterized primarily by progressive weakness and degeneration of skeletal muscle. The most common form, Duchenne Muscular Dystrophy has been known in humans since the 19th Century, and is known to be inherited as an X-linked recessive trait that affects approximately one in every three thousand males worldwide (Ozawa et al. 1998).

In 1987, the gene's protein product was identified and termed dystrophin (Hoffman et al. 1987). Briefly, dystrophin provides structure, thus keeping muscle cells intact. Without dystrophin, the membranes become unstable and permeable to substances that would not ordinarily enter the cells (Ozawa et al. 1998). The onset of DMD is characterized by progressive muscle wasting and increased fat and connective tissue replacement of degenerated muscle fibers in humans. Symptoms typically begin to appear between the ages of two and five, with most affected males confined to a wheelchair by age twelve and rarely living past their twenties (Emery 1998, Willmann et al. 2009).

Fetal Alcohol Spectrum Disorder (FASD)

FASD, an umbrella term commonly used to describe the effects of prenatal ethanol exposure (including the historic term Fetal Alcohol Syndrome), results in an alcohol induced dysmorphology characterized by growth deficiencies, CNS abnormalities, and craniofacial changes, but has no known genetic component (Astley and Clarren 2000). As a result, the specific insult to the developmental system is identical in all model organisms (though variations in dosage have been the subject of many experiments).

As potentially any animal could be used as a model for fetal alcohol exposure, FASD represents a unique case of a common, medically relevant disorder caused solely by an environmentally induced insult to the developmental program. As a result, divergence in symptomatic traits among model organisms can be inferred to reflect otherwise cryptic divergence in the developmental and regulatory genome. Placing animal models into their proper phylogenetic context allows the opportunity for greater understanding of the differential

effects of alcohol as a product of the independent evolution of each lineage used in experimental work. In the present case, animal models used in studying FASD range from the common fruit fly (McClure et al. 2010) to rhesus monkeys (Clarren 1999). Thus, the only effects of alcohol on development in *Drosophila* that may be relevant to humans are those that affect homologous genes and developmental pathways that can be traced back nearly 600 million years to the Cambrian explosion.

In order to examine the utility of phylogenetic data in providing insight into both inherited genetic conditions and non-inherited insults during development, we place two well-studied animal model systems in a phylogenetic context for the first time. Consequently, we test the hypotheses that identified symptoms amongst animal models and humans may be homologous at different levels within the phylogeny of animals that may be inferred with graded levels of confidence using phylogenetic methods.

Methods

We conducted a comprehensive search of available databases for literature on DMD and FASD (and related terms) in model animals, ultimately yielding experimental or clinical papers published since 1973, describing the symptoms of these conditions in humans and animal models. We used 39 papers that provide novel or summary descriptions of DMD symptoms in twelve (12) putative model organisms and humans, while for FASD, we sourced 42 publications that describe phenotypic manifestations also in twelve (12) non-human animals as well as the condition in humans, bringing the total for each condition to 13 species.

The analysis of character distribution in phylogeny is based on the assumption that the characters are independent of one another (Shaffer 1986, Shaffer and Voss 1996), though that is often not the case (Wilkinson 1995). The use of characters that represent character complexes (also called functional complexes) in phylogenetic analysis has the effect of over-representing what might otherwise be singular underlying causes. Nonetheless, these can be used in phylogenetic analyses when they are treated as single units (Kluge 1989, Lauder 1990). Character complexes may be identified *a priori* based upon knowledge of the biology of the traits, or through analysis of character correlation within a phylogenetic framework (Emerson and Hastings 1998, Wilkinson 1995). The potential for over-representation of characters makes it important to identify possible complexes in any study. In the present case, for example, FASD researchers have cited “reduced intelligence” in humans and model organisms (Streissguth 1986, Meyer and Riley 1986), while others have noted “reduced neocortex size” in some of the same taxa (Valenzuela et al. 2012). As the former is almost undoubtedly a

functional result of the latter, these can reasonably be inferred to represent a biological character complex *a priori*. Similarly, redundancies were eliminated based on descriptions interpreted as synonymous when they seemed to differ only qualitatively (e.g., cleft lip and cleft palate) or in word choice (e.g., infra-nasal depression and philtrum in FASD). As a result, we reduced the total characters found for DMD to 39 non-redundant symptomatic traits or characters included in our analysis, while 140 subtly unique descriptions of FASD symptoms were reduced to 57 non-redundant characters. Given the sequence of developmental events, we regard neurological characters of FASD as likely primary causes of many non-neurological characters, though clear correlations were difficult to substantiate in all cases. As a result, characters were divided into neurological and non-neurological traits and analyzed for biological correlation only within these groupings. Character correlations across these groupings may remain unidentified in the analyses.

A character-taxon matrix was constructed for each test (DMD and FASD), wherein the symptomatic traits were arbitrarily treated as derived character states, wildtype conditions treated as primitive (unaffected), and characters with no data for any given species were treated as unknowns. The amount of data available for each species was not equal; absence of reported symptoms was not presumed to indicate evidence of the absence of the symptoms, with that designation restricted to circumstances where researchers offered specific affirmation that a symptom was absent in a particular taxon. Traits found among derived taxa that could not possibly manifest in more primitive taxa due to absent homologous structures (e.g., forebrain in arthropods, ptosis in fish, etc.) were assigned a value of “absent” in taxa that could not possibly possess them.

Characters were optimized onto abbreviated cladograms of animals (Price et al. 2005, Peterson et al. 2008, Lockwood et al. 2004, Chiari et al. 2012), using Mesquite (Maddison and Maddison 2011) which uses maximum parsimony in character inference for taxa with unknown character states and the AccTran algorithm (favoring reversals over convergences when the choices are equally parsimonious (Farris 1970, Wiley et al. 1991). Root node values were coded as unknown.

Characters absent in the analyses were inferred using maximum parsimony and characterized following the terminology associated with the Extant Phylogenetic Bracket (EPB) method of Witmer (1995) for the inference of unpreserved attributes. The use of maximum parsimony often results in all traits inferred to be primitive in studies including taxa with unknown character states, but fails to make explicit the confidence with which those inferences can be made, a shortcoming that can be corrected following EPB terminology. Consequently, a Level 1 inference is one which is

supported by phylogenetic information in bracketing sister taxa for any taxon with an unknown character state (Level 1' in Witmer 1995). That is, traits can be inferred with highest confidence when unambiguously affirmed by phylogeny. Level 2 inferences are those which are supported only by phylogenetic information provided by a single sister taxon, and are thus ambiguous with regard to ancestral character states, clearly a lower level of confidence (Witmer 1995). In the present study, symptomatic traits were optimized to the lowest node where a Level 1 inference could be made. Remaining traits could be inferred with Level 2 confidence, a more speculative inference, in taxa falling outside of the clade where Level 1 inferences were made.

Results and Discussion

Analyses of both DMD and FASD datasets resulted in similar findings, with a minority of symptoms definitively identified as present or absent in animal models for both cases, but providing distributions that allow for Level 1 inferences (highest confidence based on unambiguous phylogeny; 31.8% and 36.2% respectively; see Table 1). This illustrates the fact that a large number of model organisms have been incompletely surveyed for symptoms and suggests they are not being maximally utilized.

Table 1. Summary of documented and inferred symptomatic traits for DMD and FASD. In both cases, a majority of likely symptoms remain undocumented, but more than 30% of unknown character states are strongly supported by phylogeny in both studies.

	DMD	FASD
Species	13	13
Symptoms	39	57
Total Character States	507	741
Characters Observed	132 (26.0%)	209 (28.2%)
Level 1 Inferences	161 (31.8%)	268 (36.2%)
Level 2 Inferences	214 (42.2%)	264 (35.6%)

DMD Results

Of the nearly 400 inferred character states in the analysis of DMD, 161 can be inferred with the highest, Level 1, confidence based on the fact that the evidence from phylogeny unambiguously suggests that these characters should be present in cases where they remain undocumented. Most of these Level 1 inferred character states map to the level of Mammalia (see Figure 1), suggesting that the underlying genetic programs for these 23 symptoms are tied to mammalian synapomorphies, or shared-derived characters. Five symptoms seem to characterize Amniota, one is inferred for all vertebrates, four characterize protostomes and only a single character

Character Optimization of Duchenne Muscular Dystrophy

Figure 1. Character Optimization – DMD Symptoms. DMD symptoms are most commonly attributed to Mammals, though there are symptoms that characterize each node within the clade of animals studied. Open circles indicate possible loss of a character.

is present in all species examined. In addition, five may be unique to humans or are untested outside of our species (see Figure 1; Table 2).

Research into DMD has made unusually dense use of the dog as an animal model, with at least ten breeds of dogs represented in the research. Interestingly, different breeds of dog do not all present with identical symptoms, though certainly the breeds have not been equally well studied. The Irish Terrier, for example, presents no evidence of fat infiltration of muscle fibers (Wentink et al 1972) while the other nine breeds all do (analysis not illustrated). Indeed, the symptom appears to characterize all amniotes, indicating that the absence of fat infiltration in Irish Terriers may be unique (autapomorphic), further suggesting that this breed might present useful genetic data not found in other breeds of dogs, or indeed in any other species.

Within Mammalia, autosomal inheritance of DMD is unusual, only found in the mink (Hegreberg et al. 1975, Hegreberg et al. 1976) and hamster (Homburger et al.

1966), whereas the condition is x-linked amongst other mammals. The gene is also known to be autosomal in both turkeys (Schmitz and Harper 1975) and chickens (Dominguez-Steglich et al. 1990), suggesting that the primitive condition for DMD is an autosomal pattern of inheritance, rather than sex-linked, which has profound implications for studies involving these taxa. Indeed, Becker Muscular Dystrophy (BMD) is known to exhibit autosomal recessive inheritance (Ozawa et al. 1998), suggesting that either these animal models may be analogues to DMD, or that DMD itself may have evolved from BMD.

Several other characters (weight gain, gingival overgrowth, ectopic calcifications, and extended viral-induced papillomas) are only known in dogs and known to be absent in humans. While these are likely of limited clinical interest, phylogenetic evidence for them is equivocal in other model species that might be used for veterinary research.

Table 2. DMD. Documented and inferred character states for symptomatic traits among DMD model animals. Blue line indicates phylogenetically lower level limits of Level 1 inferences (highest confidence) or Documented symptoms. Key: D = documented symptom; A = documented absent symptom; 1 = Level 1 inference; 2 = Level 2 inference. Dogs are treated as a single case, though the condition has been identified in ten breeds of dog which exhibit variation in some traits (data not shown). Data were extracted from sources indicated (*) in the references.

DMD Animal Models	Clade	Mammals													
		Amniotes													
		Vertebrates													
		Animals (Metazoans)													
		Species	Nematode	Fruit Fly	Zebrafish	Turkey	Chicken	Sheep	Mink	Cat	Dogs	Hamster	Mouse (Dy/dy)	Mouse (Mdx)	Human
Trait															
Abnormal Gait	D	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	D	D	1	1	1	D	
Dystrophin absent	2	D	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	1	1	D	D		
Skeletal Muscle Fiber Degeneration	2	D	1	D	1	1	D	D	D	D	1	D	D		
Cardiac Failure/ Cardiomyopathy	2	D	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	D	1	1	D		
Arrhythmia	2	D	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	1	1	D		
Calcium Staining on Muscle Fibers	2	2	D	1	1	1	1	D	D	1	1	D	D		
Recessive	2	2	2	D	1	1	D	1	D	1	1	1	D		
Muscle Fibrosus	2	2	2	D	1	1	1	1	D	1	1	1	D		
Increased Fat Infiltration of Muscle Fiber	2	2	2	D	1	1	D	1	D*	1	1	1	D		
Lesions on Muscle Fibers	2	2	2	D	1	1	1	1	D	1	1	1	D		
Cell Fiber Shape Variation	2	2	2	D	1	1	D	1	D	D	1	1	D		
Early Progressive Onset	2	2	2	2	2	D	D	D	D	D	1	1	D		
Cardiac Muscle Fiber Degeneration	2	D	2	A	2	1	1	1	D	D	1	1	D		
Centrally located Nuclei in Skeletal Muscle Fibers	2	2	2	2	2	1	D	1	D	D	1	1	D		
Presence of Phagocytic Cells	2	2	2	2	2	1	D	1	D	1	1	1	D		
X-Linked (non-autosomal)	2	2	2	A	A	1	A	D	D	A	A	D	D		
Skeletal Muscle Fiber Regeneration	2	2	2	A	2	1	1	1	D	1	1	1	D		
Increased Serum Creatin Kinase	2	2	2	2	2	1	1	D	D	1	1	D	D		
Decreased Respiratory Function	2	2	2	2	2	1	1	D	D	1	1	1	D		
Non-Ambulatory	2	2	2	2	2	1	1	D	D	1	1	1	D		

Decreased Muscle Movement in Neonates	2	2	2	2	2	1	1	D	D	1	1	1	D
Reduced Tongue Functionality	A	2	2	2	2	1	1	D	D	1	1	1	D
Weight Loss	2	2	2	2	2	1	1	D	1	1	1	D	D
Renal Failure	2	2	2	2	2	1	1	D	1	1	1	1	D
Decreased Serum Creatin Kinase with Age	2	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	D	1	1	1	D
Kyphosis and Pelvic Limbs Shift Forward	A	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	D	1	1	1	D
Late Progressive Onset	2	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	D	1	1	1	D
Cognitive Disability	2	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	D	1	1	D	D
Masticatory Abnormalities and Salivation	2	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	D	1	1	1	D
Weight Gain	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	D	2	2	2	A
Gingival Overgrowth	A	A	2	2	2	2	2	2	D	2	2	2	A
Extended Viral-Induced Papillomas	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	D	2	2	2	A
Ectopic Calcifications	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	D	2	2	2	A
Decreased Diameter of Myofibers	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	D	2	2	2	A
Mineralization of Muscle Fibers	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	A	2	2	2	D
Dilation of Sarcoplasmic Reticulum	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	D
Complex EMG Discharges	A	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	D
Retinal Abnormalities	A	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	D
Hearing Impairment	A	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	D

FASD Results

Within the FASD dataset, 57 symptomatic characters are directly observable in 209 cases, leaving 532 characters states that must be inferred, of which 268 can be inferred with Level 1 Confidence. Of these, the majority of symptoms of FASD also seem to characterize Mammalia (24 of 41 characters that can be inferred at Level 1 Confidence). One trait appears to be inherited at the level of Amniota, while ten additional traits characterize Vertebrates. Five traits appear to characterize all animal models, though they are inferred in 37% of species studied. Finally, two traits characterize primates, while four FASD characters characterize humans, with two of them exhibiting convergence in either rats or mice, with documented absence in intervening model animals (see Figure 2; Table 3).

The available literature on FASD is strongly biased in favor of human medicine and mouse models, with these organisms boasting the highest numbers of total documented symptoms (47 and 42 respectively), with ferrets and dogs having the fewest (2 each). A single undocumented trait can be inferred with Level 1 confidence for humans, a reduction in cranial neural crest cells, a trait that cannot be readily studied experimentally. Highest confidence inferences in other species range from none (Fruit fly) to more than 30 previously undocumented symptomatic traits in a number of model species (see Figures 2; Table 3).

Highly fundamental symptoms of FASD seem to characterize all or nearly all animal models, including microcephaly, reduced body size, and reduced viability. Vertebrates appear to be characterized by a reduction in cranial neural crest cells (Cartwright and Smith 1995),

Character Optimization of Fetal Alcohol Spectrum Disorder

Figure 2. Character optimization – FASD Symptoms. FASD symptoms are most commonly attributed to Mammals, though there are symptoms that characterize each node within the clade of animals studied. Open circles indicate loss of a character. Neurological characters are listed in blue.

musculoskeletal, reproductive, circulatory defects, as well as a large number of facial dysmorphologies. Mammals, by far the most thoroughly studied, are characterized by a large number of neurological and non-neurological symptomatic traits, with non-neurological symptomatic traits including many classic facial dysmorphologies as well as non-cranial defects. Within mammals, sheep, guinea pigs, mice, macaques, and humans all present autapomorphic (unique) conditions not seen in other taxa, while primates also present two synapomorphic (shared-derived) traits, reduction in brain stem development and epicanthic folds (Lebel et al. 2011, Miller 2007), perhaps the most easily recognized phenotype of FASD in some human populations.

A reduction in cranial neural crest cells correlates with a large number of facial dysmorphologies, characterizing all vertebrates. Given the causative role of neural crest cells in the development of numerous facial structures (Johnston 1966), it seems likely that these traits may ultimately prove to be a character complex, with the effects on skeletal and soft-tissue structures solely the result of cranial neural crest cell reduction. Indeed, the fact that shortened noses are known in chicken (Ahlgren

et al. 2002) and consequently appear to characterize amniotes, suggests that other craniofacial dysmorphologies may simply be more readily identified in mammals but actually characterize larger clades. Other vertebrate characters include primarily mesodermally derived structures, indicating that additional cell lines or developmental pathways are affected beyond neural crest cells.

Autapomorphic traits among mammals include dramatic craniofacial defects such as aglossia (O’Leary-Moore et al. 2011) as well as comparatively minor defects (decreased peripheral arterial resistance (Ramadoss et al. 2006, Parnell et al. 2007)). These traits suggest divergence in developmental programming that leaves some taxa more vulnerable to alcohol insults than others. Note, however, that in the present study we did not control for dosage differences across animal model groups, leaving open the possibility that these symptoms could simply occur at different threshold levels than seen in other taxa, a feature that has been shown to affect embryo viability (Becker and Shibley 1998, Carvan and Loucks 2004, Oxendine et al. 2006).

Table 3. FASD. Documented and inferred character states for symptomatic traits among model FASD Animals. Blue line indicates phylogenetically lower-level limits of Level 1 inferences (highest confidence) or Documented symptoms. Key: D = documented symptom; A = documented absent symptom; 1 = Level 1 inference; 2 = Level 2 inference. Data were extracted from sources indicated (**) in the references.

Subdivision (Neuro / Non-Neuro)	Clade	Species	Trait	Mammals												
				Amniotes												
				Vertebrates												
				Animals (Metazoans)												
				Fruit Fly	Zebrafish	Medaka Fish	Chicken	Sheep	Pig	Ferret	Dog	Guinea Pig	Rat	Mouse	Macaque	Human
Neurological Symptomatic Traits	Microencephaly	D	1	1	D	A	2	2	2	D	D	D	D	D		
	Neuronal Cell Loss	D	1	D	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	D	D	D		
	Cranial Neural Crest Cell Reduction	A	D	1	D	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	1		
	Holoprosencephaly	A	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	D		
	Ventriculomegaly	A	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	D		
	Optic Nerve Hypoplasia	A	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	D	D	1	D		
	Optic Nerve Coloboma	A	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	D		
	Forebrain Hypertrophy	A	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	D	D		
	Corpus Callosum Abnormalities	A	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	D	D		
	Limbic System Dysgenesis	A	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	D	D	D	D	D		
	Basal Ganglia Hypoplasia	A	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	D		
	Pituitary Dysgenesis	A	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	D		
	Reduced Cerebellum	A	2	2	2	D	1	1	1	1	1	D	D	D		
	Neuron Dysgenesis	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	D	D	1	D		
	Glial Dysgenesis	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	1	D		
	Reduced Astroglial Proliferation	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	1	D		
	Delayed Myelination	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	1	D		
	Glial Neuronal Heterotopia	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	D	A	A	D		
	Anencephaly	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	D		
	Exencephaly	A	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	D	2	2		
Forebrain Hypoplasia	A	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	D	A	D			
Reduced Brain Stem	A	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	D	D			
Non-Neurological	Microcephaly	D	D	D	D	1	1	1	D	D	D	D	D	D		
	Reduced Body Size	D	D	D	D	A	D	D	D	D	D	D	D	D		
	Reduced Viability	D	D	1	D	1	D	1	1	1	1	D	1	D		
	Shortened Palpebral Fissure Length	A	D	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	D	D		
	Micrognathia	2	D	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	D	D		

Ear Deformities	A	D	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	D
Microphthalmia	A	D	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	D	D	D
Cyclopia	2	D	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	D
Eye Deformities	2	D	1	D	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	D
Impaired Visual Function	2	D	1	1	1	1	D	1	1	1	1	D	1	D
Heart Dysgenesis	2	D	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	D
Axial Musculoskeletal Dysmorphisms	A	D	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	1	D
Spontaneous Abortion	2	2	D	2	1	D	1	1	A	2	D	1	D	
Short Rostrum (Nose)	A	2	2	D	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	D	D	
Narrow Forehead	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	D	D	
Thin Upper Lip	A	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	D	D	
Cleft Lip	A	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	D	
Smooth Philtrum	A	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	D	D	
Maxillary Hypoplasia	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	D	
Vascular Dysgenesis	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	D	
Overly Expanded Pericardium	A	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	D	
Appendicular Musculoskeletal Deformities	2	2	2	2	D	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	D	
Reduced Liver Size	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	1	D	
Urogenital Deformities	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	D	1	D	
Epicanthic Folds	A	A	A	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	D	D	
Scaphocephaly	A	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	D	2	
Ptosis	A	A	A	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	D	
Choanal Atresia	A	A	A	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	D	2	2	
Aglossia	A	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	D	2	2	
Anophthalmia	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	D	2	2	
Decreased Peripheral Resistance	2	2	2	2	D	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	
Hypercapnia	2	2	2	2	D	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	
Pericardial Edema	A	D	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	
Reduced Skeletal Ossification	A	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	D	
Reduced Bone Strength	A	2	2	2	D	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	

Discussion

Overall, the application of cladistic character optimization to the study of animal models identifies phenomena that are characteristic of evolutionary studies more generally, features such as evolutionary convergences, reversals, synapomorphic and autapomorphic characters, only in the context of disease or inherited disorders. The utility of these data is largely unexplored,

though there is a long-standing discussion about the failure rate of therapies developed with animal models that has been attributed to species-specific (i.e., evolutionary) differences between model and target (Pound and Ritskes-Hoitinga 2018). This research suggests that some symptoms manifest due to homology in model animals, which may improve response to treatments.

It is apparent that sample bias in the development of model animals strongly favors placental mammals (Eutheria) in both cases presented here, and likely in general. While our results show a large number of synapomorphies characterize eutherian mammals, the lack of marsupial and monotremes leaves open the question of whether or not the symptoms characterize Mammalia or just Eutheria. Beyond that, the only other amniotes sampled are birds in each case, which leaves the remainder of Amniota unknown. While reptiles and amphibians may not be common model animals for these cases, the phylogenetic approach presented here may be used to identify cases where any number of species may make suitable models that are comparatively easy to keep in the laboratory.

Evolutionary reversals and convergences represent indications of evolutionary solutions to symptoms in both DMD and FASD. For example, sheep fail to exhibit reduced brain size (microencephaly) and reduced body size with ethanol exposure; (Ramadoss et al. 2006), otherwise both are synapomorphies for all model animals, potentially providing the opportunity to develop negative animal models for given symptoms (see Rand 2008). Similarly, guinea pigs apparently lack spontaneous abortion (Gibson et al. 2000) otherwise demonstrated across vertebrates (see Fig. 2, Table 3). Likewise, macaques exhibit conditions apparently homologous to the human reaction, except that they do not experience forebrain hypoplasia (Lebel et al. 2011, Sulik et al. 1981), nor do they exhibit glial neuronal heterotopia (Guerri et al. 2001, Stromland and Dolores 2002). Assuming these reports are accurate, macaques then represent a natural negative model for at least these symptoms of fetal alcohol exposure. A better understanding of the biology of these reversals may prove beneficial to the development of therapeutic techniques.

Convergent evolution is also apparent among animal models examined to date. Specifically, humans and mice may both exhibit forebrain hypoplasia in FASD (Lebel et al. 2011, Sulik et al. 1981), while humans and rats exhibit glial heterotopia (Guerri et al. 2001, Stromland and Dolores 2002). Both conditions are documented as absent in macaques and other close mammalian relatives (see Table 3).

Autapomorphic responses in humans may not actually be unique. Descriptions of the absence of characters in model animals are irregular at best, with few papers providing clear affirmations of absence in either DMD or FASD. In DMD, for example, hearing impairment is only known to characterize humans, but we found no evidence that this was examined in any model species. Similarly, studies of FASD in model animals vary in both timing and dosage of ethanol exposure, and resulting symptoms which may appear unique, may only be unique because of specific experimental conditions

carried out in those studies. Indeed, our research suggests that body mass controlled dosage experiments may be differentially informative. Likewise, apparently unique characters in humans may either be unique to our species or may be due to exposure to additional non-alcoholic terato-gens, such as illicit drugs and tobacco (Abel 1995, Becker and Shibley 1998), which cannot be controlled in human studies, and suggests caution in confidence levels of these traits.

The use of parsimony in reconstruction of ancestral character states to infer undocumented symptoms in model organisms is only one possible tool for phylogenetic inference. Indeed, there is significant recent debate on whether parsimony is the most suitable option for such inferences (Wright and Hillis 2014, Sansom et al. 2018) though it seems that parsimony is appropriate for morphological characters (Goloboff et al. 2018). In any case, a similar analysis of molecular or other data from model organisms making use of Bayesian or other probability-based models of character evolution could also be expected to provide similar insights. The use of a phylogenetically rigorous comparative method has long been shown to provide insights that ahistorical approaches to biology fail to identify (Harvey and Pagel 1991) and we recommend any approach to animal model evaluation that includes evolutionary history.

Conclusions

While excellent reviews of model animals exist for many biomedical issues, (Driscoll et al. 1990, Collins and Morgan 2003, Willmann et al. 2009, Pound and Ritskes-Hoitinga 2018), none have previously examined symptoms or traits for phylogenetic correlations. Placing symptoms of diseases and disorders into their proper evolutionary (phylogenetic) context clarifies existing shortcomings in our understanding of the diversification of developmental systems affected as well as clearly indicates where we lack information in the development of symptoms in model organisms. Understanding this diversification can elucidate both potential advantages and disadvantages among possible animal models and may provide insight into developmental pathways or disease progression.

The choice of model organism development, however, is exceedingly complex, requiring that researchers balance decisions ranging from degree of recapitulation of the target condition in the model to the availability and cost of keeping the model species, as well as issues of ethics, regulation, and more. While it is no surprise that evolutionary divergence has led to differences in manifestation of disease or disorder between model animals and targets (Eaton and Wishart 2017), it is not necessary to accept that model species can only be used to understand basic molecular biology (Keifer and Summers 2016) when we can improve our

assessment of their utility through the use of the comparative phylogenetic method. Placing model organisms into their evolutionary context for evaluation does not simply identify other primates as the best model for humans, but may identify which species might best be used to solve particular problems and can facilitate ethical choices. A diverse array of animal models is likely necessary for solving complex biomedical problems. For example, a recent study demonstrates a correlation between maternal alcohol consumption and bone breakage in children not diagnosed with FASD (Parviainen et al 2020), which may indicate that relatively weak cortical bone in humans is an undocumented FASD characteristic. Among models this condition is only known in sheep (Ramadoss et al. 2006) and is unlikely to be seen in rodent models because their bones do not exhibit intracortical remodeling, likely a function of body size (Frost 1976). Accordingly, while sheep do not fully recapitulate FASD in humans, they may be invaluable to the study of bone strength and not suitably replaced with rodent models.

The case studies used here were chosen to test the utility of studying an inherited disorder (DMD) as well as the responses to a developmental insult, exposure to ethanol (FASD). The data for DMD suggest that this method of analysis provides evidence of evolution of the symptoms of DMD across a diverse array of species. We suggest that the symptoms may reflect the large number of systems with which the dystrophin molecule interacts, and that the differential symptoms are reflective of evolutionary diversification in those systems. The case of fetal alcohol exposure was chosen because it represents an identical insult to development in all species. As a result, deviations in the response to that insult are necessarily reflective of divergence in developmental pathways amongst animals studied. This may be quite similar to a case where a mutation in one gene like dystrophin can have wide ranging effects because of the numerous interactions of the dystrophin molecule. While it is unsurprising that the majority of traits map to the common ancestor of the eutherian model mammal species in both cases, it is nonetheless highly informative to be able to infer unpreserved symptoms in species that have not been examined for all traits. Indeed, this approach has identified hundreds of untested hypotheses within animal models for both DMD and FASD and could be applied to numerous other diseases and conditions. For example, one of the leading causes of death in DMD cases is cardiomyopathy, which had been demonstrated in human, hamsters, (Homburger et al. 1966, Willmann et al. 2009), dogs (Herrtage and Houlton 1979, Valentine et al. 1992), and fruit fly (Lloyd and Taylor 2010). Based on the phylogenetic distribution of the trait, we infer the presence of cardiomyopathy in the remaining mammal model organisms with Level 1 confidence, while other species require a Level 2

inference. The phylogenetic approach to animal model development suggested here could result in a more thorough, systematic evaluation of symptom distribution and consequently more effective translation of model animal research. We look forward to improvements in systematic collection of animal model symptom data that may confirm or refute the inferences articulated above, and so improve outcomes of research on DMD, FASD, and the application of this methodology to other inherited and induced medical conditions.

Acknowledgments

The authors thank D. B. Weishampel for discussions and comments on a previous draft of this manuscript. We thank S. von Brueckwitz, A. Chinae, and V. Suslovitch for assistance with data collection and preliminary analyses. The reviews provided by F. Varriale and J. Organ were immensely valuable in improving the paper, and we thank them for their dedicated efforts.

Referees

Frank J. Varriale - FrankVarriale@kings.edu
Kings College

Jason M. Organ - jorgan@iupui.edu
Indiana University

References

*References marked with asterisks were used to provide source data included in the analyses (*DMD; **FASD).*

- **Abel, E. 1995. An update on incidence of FAS: FAS is not an equal opportunity birth defect. *Neurotoxicology and Teratology* 17: 437–443. [CrossRef](#)
- **Abel, E.L. and J.H. Hannigan. 1995. Maternal risk factors in Fetal Alcohol Syndrome: Provocative and permissive influences. *Neurotoxicology and Teratology* 17: 445–462. [CrossRef](#)
- **Ahlgren, S., Thakur, V. and M. Bronner-Fraser. 2002. Sonic hedgehog rescues cranial neural crest from cell death induced by ethanol exposure. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 99: 10476–10481. [CrossRef](#)
- *Allen, E.R. and J.F. May. 1979. Aspects of normal and dystrophic chicken muscle grown in vitro. *Virchows Archiv B Cell Pathology* 31: 243–250. [CrossRef](#)
- *Anderson, J.E., Ovalle, W.K., and B.H. Bressler. 1987. Electron microscopic and autoradiographic characterization of hindlimb muscle regeneration in the mdx mouse. *The Anatomical Record* 219(3): 243–257. [CrossRef](#)
- *Arahata, K., Hayashi, Y.K., Koga, R., Goto, K., Lee, J.H., Miyagoe, Y., et al. 1993. Laminin in animal

- models for Muscular Dystrophy defect of Laminin M in skeletal and cardiac muscles and peripheral nerve of the homozygous dystrophic dy/dy mice. *Proceedings of the Japan Academy, Series B* 69(10): 259–264. [CrossRef](#)
- **Astley, S.J. 2011. Canadian palpebral fissure length growth charts reflect a good fit for two school and FASD clinic-based US populations. *Canadian Journal of Clinical Pharmacology* 18(2): e231–e241.
- **Astley, S.J., Bailey, D., Talbot, C. and S.K. Clarren. 2000. Fetal alcohol syndrome (FAS) primary prevention through FAS diagnosis: II. A comprehensive profile of 80 birth mothers of children with FAS. *Alcohol and Alcoholism* 35(5): 509–519. [CrossRef](#)
- **Astley, S.J. and S. Clarren. 2000. Diagnosing the full spectrum of Fetal Alcohol-exposed individuals: Introducing the 4-Digit Diagnostic Code. *Alcohol and Alcoholism* 35: 400–410. [CrossRef](#)
- *Barnard, E.A., Lyles, J.M. and J.A. Pizzey. 1982. Fiber types in chicken skeletal muscles and their changes in muscular dystrophy. *The Journal of Physiology*. 331: 333–354. [CrossRef](#)
- *Bassett, D. and P.D. Currie. 2004. Identification of a zebrafish model of muscular dystrophy. *Clinical and Experimental Pharmacology and Physiology* 31: 537–540. [CrossRef](#)
- **Becker, H.C., Diaz-Granados, J. and C.L. Randall. 1996. Teratogenic actions of ethanol in the mouse: A minireview. *Pharmacology Biochemistry and Behavior* 55: 501–513. [CrossRef](#)
- **Becker, S. and I. Shibley. 1998. Teratogenicity of ethanol in different chicken strains. *Alcohol and Alcoholism* 33: 457–464. [CrossRef](#)
- **Bilotta, J., Barnett, J.A., Hancock, L. and S. Saszik. 2004. Ethanol exposure alters zebrafish development: a novel model of fetal alcohol syndrome. *Neurotoxicology and Teratology* 26(6): 737–743. [CrossRef](#)
- *Bridges, L.R. 1986. The association of cardiac muscle necrosis and inflammation with the degenerative and persistent myopathy of MDX mice. *Journal of the Neurological Sciences* 72(2–3): 147–157. [CrossRef](#)
- *Brockdorff, N., Cross, G.S., Cavanna, J.S., Fisher, E.M.C., Lyon, M.F., Davies, K.E., et al. 1987. The mapping of a cDNA from the human X-linked Duchenne muscular dystrophy gene to the mouse X chromosome. *Nature* 328: 166–168. [CrossRef](#)
- *Bulfield, G., Siller, W.G., Wight, P.A.L. and K.J. Moore. 1984. X chromosome-linked muscular dystrophy (mdx) in the mouse. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 81: 1189–1192. [CrossRef](#)
- *Carpenter, J.L., Hoffman, E.P., Romanul, F.C.A., Kunkel, L.M., Rosales, R.K., Ma, N.S.A., et al. 1989. Feline muscular dystrophy with dystrophin deficiency. *American Journal of Pathology* 135(5): 909–919.
- **Cartwright, M.M. and S.M. Smith. 1995. Increased cell death and reduced neural crest cell numbers in ethanol-exposed embryos: Partial basis for the Fetal Alcohol Syndrome phenotype. *Alcoholism: Clinical and Experimental Research* 19(2): 378–386. [CrossRef](#)
- **Carvan, M.J. and E. Loucks. 2004. Strain-dependent effects of developmental ethanol exposure in Zebrafish. *Neurotoxicology and Teratology* 26: 745–755. [CrossRef](#)
- **Carvan, M.J., Loucks, E., Weber, D.N. and F.E. Williams. 2004. Ethanol effects on the developing zebrafish: neurobehavior and skeletal morphogenesis. *Neurotoxicology and teratology* 26(6): 757–768. [CrossRef](#)
- Chiari, Y., Cahais, V., Galtier, N., and F. Delsuc. 2012. Phylogenomic analyses support the position of turtles as the sister group of birds and crocodiles (Archosauria). *BMC Biology* 10: 65 <https://doi.org/10.1186>. [CrossRef](#)
- **Clarren, S.K., 1999. Fetal alcohol syndrome: changes in craniofacial form with age, cognition, and timing of ethanol exposure in the macaque. *Teratology* 59: 163–172. [CrossRef](#)
- *Collins, C.A. and J.E. Morgan. 2003. Duchenne's muscular dystrophy: animal models used to investigate pathogenesis and develop therapeutic strategies. *International Journal of Experimental Pathology* 84: 165–172. [CrossRef](#)
- *Cooper, J.L., Valentine, B.A., Wilson, S., Patterson, D.F. and P.W. Concannon. 1988. Canine muscular dystrophy: confirmation of X-linked inheritance. *The Journal of Heredity* 79(6): 405–408. [CrossRef](#)
- *Coulton, G.R., Morgan, J.E., Partridge, T.A. and J.C. Sloper. 1988. The mdx mouse skeletal muscle myopathy: I. A histological, morphometric and biochemical investigation. *Neuropathy and Applied Neurobiology* 14(1): 53–70. [CrossRef](#)
- Darwin, C.R. 1871. *The Descent of Man, and Selection in Relation to Sex*. John Murray, London, United Kingdom. [CrossRef](#)
- *Dominguez-Steglich, M., Meng, G., Bettecken, T., Müller, C.R. and M. Schmid. 1990. The dystrophin gene is autosomally located on a microchromosome in chicken. *Genomics* 8(3): 536–540. [CrossRef](#)
- **Driscoll, C.D., Streissguth, A.P. and E.P. Riley. 1990. Prenatal alcohol exposure: Comparability of effects in humans and animal models. *Neurotoxicology and Teratology* 12: 231–237. [CrossRef](#)
- Eaton, S.L. and T.M. Wishart. 2017. Bridging the gap: large animal models in neurodegenerative research. *Mammalian Genome* 28: 324–337. [CrossRef](#)
- Emerson, S.B. and P.A. Hastings. 1998. Morphological correlations in evolution: Consequences for

- phylogenetic analysis. *The Quarterly Review of Biology* 73(2): 141–162. [CrossRef](#)
- *Emery, A.E. 1998. The muscular dystrophies. *BMJ* 317(7164): 991–995. [CrossRef](#)
- Farris, J.S., 1970. Methods of computing Wagner trees. *Systematic Zoology* 19: 83–92. [CrossRef](#)
- Frost, H.M. 1976. Some concepts crucial to the effective study of bone turnover and bone balance in human skeletal disease and in experimental models of skeletal physiology and pathophysiology. Pages 219–223 in Jaworski, Z.F.G. *Proceedings of the First Workshop on Bone Morphometry*. University of Ottawa Press, Ottawa, Canada.
- **Gibson, M.A.S., Butters, N.S., Reynolds, J.N. and J.F. Brien. 2000. Effects of chronic prenatal ethanol exposure on locomotor activity, and hippocampal weight, neurons, and nitric oxide synthase activity of the young postnatal guinea pig. *Neurotoxicology and Teratology* 22(2): 183–192. [CrossRef](#)
- *Gieseler, K., Bessou, C. and L. Ségalat. 1999. Dystrobrevin- and dystrophin-like mutants display similar phenotypes in the nematode *Caenorhabditis elegans*. *Neurogenetics* 2: 87–90. [CrossRef](#)
- **Gil-Mohapel, J., Boehme, F., Kainer, L. and B.R. Christie. 2010. Hippocampal cell loss and neurogenesis after fetal alcohol exposure: insights from different rodent models. *Brain Research Reviews* 64(2): 283–303. [CrossRef](#)
- Goloboff, P.A., Torres, A. and J.S. Arias. 2018. Weighted parsimony outperforms other methods of phylogenetic inference under models appropriate for morphology. *Cladistics* 34(4): 407–437. [CrossRef](#)
- **Guerra, C., Pascual, M. and J. Renau-Piqueras. 2001. Glia and Fetal Alcohol Syndrome. *Neurotoxicology* 22: 593–599. [CrossRef](#)
- *Harper, J.A. and J.E. Parker. 1964. Hereditary muscular dystrophy in the domestic turkey, *Meleagris gallopavo*. *Poultry Science* 43: 1326–1327. [CrossRef](#)
- *Harper, J.A. and J.E. Parker. 1967. Hereditary muscular dystrophy in the domestic turkey. *The Journal of Heredity* 58: 189–193. [CrossRef](#)
- **Harris, S., Wilce, P. and K. Bedi. 2000. Exposure of rats to a high but not low dose of ethanol during early postnatal life increases the rate of loss of optic nerve axons and decreases the rate of myelination. *Journal of Anatomy* 197: 477–485. [CrossRef](#)
- Harvey, P.H. and M.D. Pagel. 1991. *The Comparative Method in Evolutionary Biology*. Oxford University Press, Oxford, United Kingdom.
- Hegen, M., Keith Jr, J.C., Collins, M. and C.L. Nickerson-Nutter. 2008. Utility of animal models for identification of potential of therapeutics for rheumatoid arthritis. *Annals of Rheumatic Diseases* 67: 1505–1515. [CrossRef](#)
- *Hegreberg, G.A., Camacho, Z. and J.R. Gorham. 1974. Histopathologic description of muscular dystrophy of mink. *Archives of Pathology* 97(4): 225–229.
- *Hegreberg, G.A., Norton, S.L. and J.R. Gorham. 1976. Animal model of human disease: muscular dystrophy. *American Journal of Pathology* 85(1): 233–236.
- *Hegreberg, G.A., Padgett, G.A., Prieur, D.J. and M.I. Johnson. 1975. Genetic studies of a muscular dystrophy of mink. *Journal of Heredity* 66: 63–66. [CrossRef](#)
- *Herrtage, E. and J.E.F. Houlton. 1966. Collapsing Clumber spaniels. *The Veterinary Record, Journal of the British Veterinary Association* 105: 334. [CrossRef](#)
- Hoffman, E.P., Brown, R.H. and L.M. Kunkel. 1987. Dystrophin: The protein product of the Duchenne muscular dystrophy locus. *Cell* 51(6): 919–928. [CrossRef](#)
- *Homburger, F., Nixon, C.W., Eppenberger, M. and J.R. Baker. 1966. Hereditary myopathy in the Syrian hamster: Studies on pathogenesis. *Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences* 138: 14–27. [CrossRef](#)
- *Hoogerwaard, E.M., Bakker, E., Ippel, P.F., Oosterwijk, J.C., Majoor-Krakauer, D.F., Leschot, N.J., et al. 1999. Signs and symptoms of Duchenne muscular dystrophy and Becker muscular dystrophy among carriers in the Netherlands: a cohort study. *The Lancet* 353(9170): 2116–2119. [CrossRef](#)
- Johnson, G.J., Griggs, T.R. and L. Badimon. 1999. The utility of animal models in the preclinical study. *Journal of Thrombosis and Haemostasis* 81: 835–843. [CrossRef](#)
- Johnston, M.C., 1966. A radioautographic study of the migration and fate of cranial neural crest cells in the chick embryo. *The Anatomical Record* 156(2): 143–155. [CrossRef](#)
- *Karpati, G., Carpenter, S. and S. Prescott. 1988. Small-caliber skeletal muscle fibers do not suffer necrosis in MDX mouse dystrophy. *Muscle & Nerve* 11(8): 795–803. [CrossRef](#)
- Kluge, A.G., 1989. A concern for evidence and a phylogenetic hypothesis of relationships among *Epicrates* (Boidae, Serpentes). *Systematic Zoology* 38: 7–25. [CrossRef](#)
- *Kornegay, J.N., Tuler, S.M., Miller, D.M. and D.C. Levesque. 1988. Muscular dystrophy in a litter of Golden Retriever dogs. *Muscle & Nerve* 11(10): 1056–1064. [CrossRef](#)
- *Kornegay, J.N., Sharp, N.J.H., Bartlett, R.J., Van Camp, S.D., Burt, C.T., Yen Hung, W., et al. 1990. Golden Retriever muscular dystrophy: monitoring for success. *Advances in Experimental Medicine and Biology* 280: 267–272. [CrossRef](#)

- Knight, A., 2008. The beginning of the end for chimpanzee experiments?. *Philosophy, Ethics, and Humanities in Medicine* 3: 16–29. [CrossRef](#)
- **Kubotsu, S.L., Hu, J., Carnahan, K.G., DeAvila, J., Ott, T.L. and M.A. Mirando. 2003. The effects of chronic ethanol consumption during early pregnancy on conceptus health and uterine function in pigs. *Alcoholism: Clinical and Experimental Research* 27(4): 712–719. [CrossRef](#)
- Lauder, G.V. 1990. Functional morphology and systematics: studying functional patterns in an historical context. *Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics* 21: 317–340. [CrossRef](#)
- **Lebel, C., Roussotte, F. and E.R. Sowell. 2011. Imaging the impact of prenatal alcohol exposure on the structure of the developing human brain. *Neuropsychology Review* 21: 102–118. [CrossRef](#)
- *Lloyd, T.E. and J.P. Taylor. 2010. Flightless flies: *Drosophila* models of neuromuscular disease. *Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences* 1184: e1–20. [CrossRef](#)
- Lockwood, C.A., Kimbel, W.H., Lynch, J.M. and D. Pilbeam. 2004. Morphometrics and Hominoid Phylogeny: Support for a chimpanzee-human clade and differentiation among Great Ape subspecies. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 101(13): 4356–4360. [CrossRef](#)
- *McGavin, M.D. and I.D. Baynes. 1969. A congenital progressive ovine muscular dystrophy. *Veterinary Pathology* 6(6): 513–524. [CrossRef](#)
- Maddison, W.P. 1997. Gene trees in species trees. *Systematic Biology* 46(3): 523–536. [CrossRef](#)
- Maddison, W.P. and D.R. Maddison. 2011. Mesquite: A modular system for evolutionary analysis. Version 2.75 <http://mesquiteproject.org>
- **May, P.A., Gossage, J.P., Kalberg, W.O., Robinson, L.K., Buckley, D., Manning, M. et al. 2009. Prevalence and epidemiologic characteristics of FASD from various research methods with an emphasis on recent in-school studies. *Developmental Disabilities Research Reviews* 15: 176–192. [CrossRef](#)
- **McClure, K., French, R. and U. Heberlein. 2010. A *Drosophila* model for fetal alcohol syndrome disorders: role for the insulin pathway. *Disease Models & Mechanisms* 4: 335–346. [CrossRef](#)
- **Medina, A.E., Krahe, T.E. and A.S. Ramoa. 2004. Early alcohol exposure induces persistent alteration of cortical columnar organization and reduced orientation selectivity in the visual cortex. *Journal of Neurophysiology* 93(3): 1317–1325. [CrossRef](#)
- **Medina, A.E., Krahe, T.E. and A.S. Ramoa. 2006. Restoration of neuronal plasticity by a phosphodiesterase Type I inhibitor in a model of fetal alcohol exposure. *The Journal of Neuroscience* 26: 1057–1060. [CrossRef](#)
- **Medina, A.E. and A.S. Ramoa. 2005. Early alcohol exposure impairs ocular dominance plasticity throughout the critical period. *Developmental Brain Research* 157: 107–111. [CrossRef](#)
- **Meyer, L.S. and E.P. Riley. 1986. Behavioral teratology of alcohol. Pages 101–140 in Riley, E.P. and C.V. Vorhees, editors. *Handbook of Behavioral Teratology*. Plenum Press, New York, USA. [CrossRef](#)
- **Miller, M.W., 2007. Exposure to ethanol during gastrulation alters somatosensory-motor cortices and the underlying white matter in the macaque. *Cerebral Cortex* 17: 2961–2971. [CrossRef](#)
- *Nakamura, A. and S. Takeda. 2010. Mammalian models of Duchenne Muscular Dystrophy: pathological characteristics and therapeutic applications. *BioMed Research International* 2011: Article ID 184393. [CrossRef](#)
- Nestler, E.J. and S.E. Hyman. 2010. Animal models of neuropsychiatric disorders. *Nature Neuroscience* 13(10): 1161–1169. [CrossRef](#)
- **O’Leary-Moore, S.K., Parnell, S.E., Lipinski, R.J. and K.K. Sulik. 2011. Magnetic resonance-based imaging in animal models of fetal alcohol spectrum disorder. *Neuropsychology Review* 21(2): 167–185. [CrossRef](#)
- **O’Shea, K.S. and M.H. Kaufman. 1979. The teratogenic effect of acetaldehyde: implications for the study of the fetal alcohol syndrome. *Journal of Anatomy* 128: 65–76.
- *Ozawa, E., Noguchi, S., Mizuno, Y., Hagiwara, Y. and M. Yoshida. 1998. From dystrophinopathy to sarcoglycanopathy: evolution of a concept of muscular dystrophy. *Muscle & Nerve* 21(4): 421–438. [CrossRef](#)
- Oxendine, S.L., Cowden, J., Hinton, D.E. and S. Padilla. 2006. Vulnerable windows for developmental ethanol toxicity in the Japanese medaka fish (*Oryzias latipes*). *Aquatic Toxicology* 80(4): 396–404. [CrossRef](#)
- **Parnell, S.E., Ramadoss, J., Delp, M.D., Ramsey, M.W., Chen, W.-J.A., and J.R. West et al. 2007. Chronic ethanol increases fetal cerebral blood flow specific to the ethanol-sensitive cerebellum under normoxaemic, hypercapnic and acidaemic conditions: ovine model. *Experimental Physiology* 92(5): 933–943. [CrossRef](#)
- Parviainen, R. Auvinen, J., Serlo, W., Järvelin, M.-R. and J.-J. Sinikumpu. 2020. Maternal alcohol consumption during pregnancy associates with bone fractures in early childhood. A birth-cohort study of 6718 participants. *Bone* 137: 115462. [CrossRef](#)
- Peterson, K.J., Cotton, J.A., Gehling, J.G. and D. Pissni. 2008. The Ediacaran emergence of bilaterians: congruence between the genetic and the geological

- fossil records. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society, London, B Biological Sciences* 363: 1435–1443. [CrossRef](#)
- Pound, P. and M. Ritskes-Hoitinga. 2018. Is it possible to overcome issues of external validity in preclinical animal research? Why most animal models are bound to fail. *Journal of Translational Medicine* 16: 304. [CrossRef](#)
- Price, S.A., Bininda-Emonds, O.R.P. and J.L. Gittleman. 2005. A complete phylogeny of the whales, dolphins and even-toed hoofed mammals (Cetartiodactyla). *Biological Reviews* 80: 445–473. [CrossRef](#)
- **Ramadoss, J., Hogan, H.A., Given, J.C., West, J.R., and T.A. Cudd. 2006. Binge alcohol exposure during all three trimesters alters bone strength and growth in fetal sheep. *Alcohol* 38(3): 185–192. [CrossRef](#)
- **Ramadoss, J., Lunde, E.R., Chen, W.-J.A., West, J.R., and T.A. Cudd. 2007. Temporal vulnerability of fetal cerebellar Purkinje cells to chronic binge alcohol exposure: ovine model. *Alcoholism: Clinical and Experimental Research* 31(10): 1738–1745. [CrossRef](#)
- **Ramadoss, J., Lunde, E.R., Piña, K.B., Chen, W.-J.A., and T.A. Cudd. 2007. All three trimester binge alcohol exposure causes fetal cerebellar purkinje cell loss in the presence of maternal hypercapnea, acidemia, and normoxemia: ovine model. *Alcoholism: Clinical and Experimental Research* 31(7): 1252–1258. [CrossRef](#)
- Rand, M. S., 2008. Selection of biomedical animal models. Pages: 9–15 in Conn, P.M., editor. *Sourcebook of Models for Biomedical Research*. Humana Press Inc., Totowa, NJ, USA. [CrossRef](#)
- Reeves, R.H., Baxter, L.L. and J.T. Richtsmeier. 2001. Too much of a good thing: mechanisms of gene action in Down syndrome. *TRENDS in Genetics* 17(2): 83–88. [CrossRef](#)
- **Reimers, M.J., Flockton, A.R. and R.L. Tanguay. 2004. Ethanol- and acetaldehyde-mediated developmental toxicity in zebrafish. *Neurotoxicology and Teratology* 26: 769–781. [CrossRef](#)
- Richtsmeier, J., Baxter, L. and R. Reeves. 2000. Parallels of craniofacial maldevelopment in Down Syndrome and Ts65Dn Mice. *Developmental Dynamics* 217(2): 137–145. [CrossRef](#)
- **Rifas, L., Towler, D.A. and L.V. Avioli. 1997. Gestational exposure to ethanol suppresses msx2 expression in developing mouse embryos. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 94(14): 7549–7554. [CrossRef](#)
- *Roberds, S.L., Ervasti, J.M., Anderson, R.D., Ohlendieck, K., Kahl, S.D., Zoloto, D. et al. 1993. Disruption of the dystrophin glycoprotein complex in the cardiomyopathic hamster. *The Journal of Biological Chemistry* 268(16): 11496–11499. [CrossRef](#)
- Sansom, R.S., Choate, P.G., Keating, J.N. and E. Randle. 2018. Parsimony, not Bayesian analysis, recovers more stratigraphically congruent phylogenetic trees. *Biology Letters* 14(6): 20180263. [CrossRef](#)
- *Schmitz, J.A. and J.A. Harper. 1975. Histopathology of hereditary muscular dystrophy of the domestic turkey (*Meleagris gallopavo*). *Canadian Journal of Comparative Medicine* 39(4): 389–396.
- Shaffer, H.B. 1986. Utility of quantitative genetic parameters in character weighting. *Systematic Biology* 35(1): 124–134. [CrossRef](#)
- Shaffer, H.B. and S.R. Voss. 1996. Phylogenetic and mechanistic analysis of a developmentally integrated character complex: alternative life history modes in ambysomatid salamanders. *American Zoologist* 36: 24–35. [CrossRef](#)
- **Streisguth, A.P., Landesman-Dwyer, S., Martin, J.C. and D.W. Smith. 1980. Teratogenic effects of alcohol in humans and laboratory animals. *Science* 209(4454): 353–361. [CrossRef](#)
- **Streisguth, A.P. 1986. The behavioral teratology of alcohol: Performance, behavioral, and intellectual deficits in prenatally exposed children. Pages 3–44 in West, J.R., editor. *Alcohol and Brain Development*. Oxford University Press, New York, USA.
- **Stromland, K. and M. Dolores. 2002. Ophthalmic involvement in the Fetal Alcohol Syndrome: Clinical and animal model studies. *Alcohol and Alcoholism* 37: 2–8. [CrossRef](#)
- **Sulik, K., Johnston, M.C. and M.A. Webb. 1981. Fetal Alcohol Syndrome: Embryogenesis in a mouse model. *Science* 214: 936–938. [CrossRef](#)
- **Sulik, K.K. 2005. Genesis of alcohol-induced craniofacial dysmorphism. *Experimental Biology and Medicine* 230: 366–375. [CrossRef](#)
- *Taghli-Lamalle, O., Akasaka, T., Hogg, G., Nudel, U., Yaffe, D., Chamberlain, J.S., et al. 2008. Dystrophin deficiency in *Drosophila* reduces lifespan and causes a dilated cardiomyopathy phenotype. *Aging Cell* 7(2): 237–249. [CrossRef](#)
- *Tsai K.L., Clark, L.A. and K.E. Murphy. 2007. Understanding hereditary diseases using the dog and human as companion model systems. *Mammalian Genome* 18(6-7): 444–451. [CrossRef](#)
- Uddin, M., Wildman, D.E., Liu, G., Xu, W., Johnson, R.M., Hof, P.R., et al., 2004. Sister grouping of chimpanzees and humans as revealed by genome-wide phylogenetic analysis of brain gene expression profiles. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 101(9): 2957–2962. [CrossRef](#)
- **Valenzuela, C.F., Morton, R.A., Diaz, M.R. and L. Topper. 2012. Does moderate drinking harm the fetal brain? Insights from animal models. *Trends in Neuroscience* 35(5): 284–292. [CrossRef](#)

- *Valentine, B.A., Winand, N.J., Pradham, D., Moise, N.S., de Lahunta, A., Kornegay, J.N., et al. 1992. Canine X-linked muscular dystrophy as an animal model of Duchenne Muscular Dystrophy: a review. *American Journal of Medical Genetics* 42: 352–356. [CrossRef](#)
- Wall, R.J. and M. Shani. 2008. Are animal models as good as we think?. *Theriogenology* 69: 2–9. [CrossRef](#)
- * Walmsley G.L. , Gomeza, V.A., Fuente, M.F., Burke, M.M., Nagel, N., Holder, A., et al. 2010 A Duchenne Muscular Dystrophy gene hot spot mutation in Dystrophin-deficient Cavalier King Charles Spaniels is amenable to exon 51 skipping. *PLOSOne* 5(1): e8647. [CrossRef](#)
- *Watchko J.F., O'Day, T.L. and E.P. Hoffman. 2002. Functional characteristics of dystrophic skeletal muscle: insights from animal models. *Journal of Applied Physiology* 93: 407–417. [CrossRef](#)
- *Wentink, G.H., van der Linde-Sipman, J.S., Meijer, A.E.F.H., Kamphuisen, H.A.C., van Vorstenbosch, C.J.A.H.V., Hartman, W., et al. 1972. Myopathy with a possible recessive x-linked inheritance in a litter of Irish Terriers. *Veterinary Pathology*. 9: 328–349. [CrossRef](#)
- Wiley, E.O., Siegel-Causey, D., Brooks, D.R. and V.A. Funk. 1991. *The Compleat Cladist: A Primer of Phylogenetic Procedures*. Special Publ. No. 19 ed. The University of Kansas Museum of Natural History, Lawrence, Kansas, USA.
- Wilkinson, M., 1995. A comparison of two methods of character construction. *Cladistics* 11(3): 297–308. [CrossRef](#)
- *Willmann, K., Possekkel, S., Dubach-Powell, J., Meier, T., and M.A. Ruegg 2009. Mammalian animal models for Duchenne muscular dystrophy. *Neuromuscular Disorders* 19: 241–249. [CrossRef](#)
- Witmer, L.M., 1995. The extant phylogenetic bracket and the importance of reconstructing soft tissues in fossils. Pages 19–33 in Thomason, J., editor. *Functional Morphology in Vertebrate Paleontology*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, United Kingdom.
- Wright, A.M. and D.M. Hillis. 2014. Bayesian analysis using a simple likelihood model outperforms parsimony for estimation of phylogeny from discrete morphological data. *PLOS One* 9(10): e109210. [CrossRef](#)
- **Yang, Y., Roussotte, F., Kan, E., Sulik, K.K., Mattson, S.N., and Riley, E.P. et al., 2012. Abnormal cortical thickness alterations in fetal alcohol spectrum disorders and their relationships with facial dysmorphology. *Cerebral Cortex* 22(5): 1170–1179. [CrossRef](#)